City Council Work Session
July 23, 2019
6:00 PM
(Amended 7/22/19)

CALL TO ORDER.

1. Larimer County Proposed Regional Transportation Tax for the November 2019 Ballot.  
   (staff: Chad Crager, Timothy Kemp, Dean Klinger, Drew Brooks, Paul Sizemore; 10 minute presentation; 30 minute discussion)  
   (This item has been withdrawn from the agenda)

   The purpose of this work session is to update Council on the plans that Larimer County has in proposing a regional transportation and County facility tax for this upcoming November 2019 ballot.

   Larimer County Commissioner Steve Johnson and Larimer County Manager Linda Hoffman will be presenting at this Work Session.

1. Staff Report: Digital Billboard Regulation.  
   (staff: Noah Beals)

2. Climate Action Plan Annual Update.  
   (staff: Jeff Mihelich, John Phelan, Lindsay Ex; 15 minute presentation; 45 minute discussion)

   The purpose of this Work Session is two-fold:

   • Provide an update on the implementation of the City’s Climate Action goals, including the preliminary 2018 community carbon inventory and highlights from 2018 actions and achievements in related policies and the various sectors (electricity, natural gas, transportation, and waste materials) on the journey to carbon neutrality;
• Seek Council’s feedback on the proposed community engagement efforts and overall planning processes for the updates to the Climate Action Plan, Energy Policy, and Road to Zero Waste Plans, as funded through the 2019-2020 budget.

• OTHER BUSINESS.

• ADJOURNMENT.
SUBJECT FOR DISCUSSION

Larimer County Proposed Regional Transportation Tax for the November 2019 Ballot.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The purpose of this work session is to update Council on the plans that Larimer County has in proposing a regional transportation and County facility tax for this upcoming November 2019 ballot.

Larimer County Commissioner Steve Johnson and Larimer County Manager Linda Hoffman will be presenting at this Work Session.

GENERAL DIRECTION SOUGHT AND SPECIFIC QUESTIONS TO BE ANSWERED

This is an opportunity for Council to provide feedback and ask questions directly of Larimer County Commissioner Steve Johnson and County Manager Linda Hoffman.

1. Is Council supportive, neutral, or opposed to the upcoming Larimer County regional tax initiative?
2. Does City Council support a measure to fund the Transit Master Plan?

BACKGROUND / DISCUSSION

The City of Fort Collins has collaborated with Larimer County and other local agencies since early 2018 on a county-wide project to develop regional transportation solutions. A list of projects was generated that would compete for funding as a result of the proposed Larimer County Regional Tax Initiative. There are 43 projects on the list from across the County and they were evaluated and prioritized based on five criteria:

- Connectivity. Does the project complete a link between communities or between major corridors?
- Multimodal. Would the project improve accommodation for multiple travel modes?
- Congestion relief. Would the project address an existing congestion problem?
- Safety mitigation. Would the project address a documented safety problem?
- Project Reach. How wide-reaching is the project and how many people would be impacted by the project?

In addition to a ¼ cent tax for transportation, an additional ¼ cent tax is also being considered for County facilities. This results in a total proposed County sales tax increase of ½-cent tax that may be on the November ballot.
Staff Concerns

While City Staff agrees in working with our regional partners to find solutions to transportation issues, City staff has reviewed the proposed initiative and project list and has the following concerns:

1. Lack of flexibility of the project list. Inevitably, over a twenty-year horizon, priorities and projects will change and other funding sources may become available. A ballot-mandated project list does not allow the County and the communities to react to changing technologies, new funding sources, and new priorities.

2. Inequitable distribution of projects. It is projected that 52% of sales tax receipts from this proposal will be collected within the City of Fort Collins. Approximately 30% of the distribution would be within the city limits. Nearby projects have indirect benefit to Fort Collins, but do not make up the difference.

3. Lack of transit solutions. The City Council priority regarding Transportation is to encourage and increase Transfort use/additional bus rapid transit (BRT) corridors. The proposed transportation tax doesn't reflect this priority.

4. Lack of public outreach.

In addition, the ¼ cent County Facility Tax was recently added with little discussion with County communities.

ATTACHMENTS

1. County Regional Transportation Infrastructure Projects Map (PDF)
SUBJECT FOR DISCUSSION

Climate Action Plan Annual Update.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The purpose of this Work Session is two-fold:

- Provide an update on the implementation of the City's Climate Action goals, including the preliminary 2018 community carbon inventory and highlights from 2018 actions and achievements in related policies and the various sectors (electricity, natural gas, transportation, and waste materials) on the journey to carbon neutrality;
- Seek Council’s feedback on the proposed community engagement efforts and overall planning processes for the updates to the Climate Action Plan, Energy Policy, and Road to Zero Waste Plans, as funded through the 2019-2020 budget.

GENERAL DIRECTION SOUGHT AND SPECIFIC QUESTIONS TO BE ANSWERED

1. Does Council have feedback on the proposed community engagement?
2. Does Council have feedback on the proposed planning process?

BACKGROUND / DISCUSSION

Overall Summary and Progress since the Goals were Adopted in 2015

Background

In 2015, Council unanimously adopted updated community greenhouse gas goals:

- 20% below 2005 levels by 2020,
- 80% below 2005 by 2030, and
- Carbon neutrality by the year 2050.

These goals are grounded in Fort Collins’ 20-year history of climate action. From the community’s first commitment in 1999, leadership has recognized that Fort Collins is uniquely positioned to lead and demonstrate how to implement pragmatic and cost-effective climate action strategies given our municipal electric utility, extensive partnerships, e.g., CSU, Platte River, etc., and innovation economy – from breweries to bikes to small business action. Since that initial commitment, Fort Collins’ has aligned these efforts with the latest global science and continued to act in a manner that aligns with the City’s seven outcome areas, commitment to leadership, and to ensure our community’s long-term resilience.

2018 Community Carbon Inventory

As noted in the July 10 memo to Council, the 2018 greenhouse gas inventory update is delayed as staff make updates to transportation data. While the changes will significantly improve the overall quality of the inventory, data is required from the State and has been slower to bring in-house than anticipated. Staff anticipates a Read
Before Memo the week of the Work Session to provide these preliminary results to Council in advance of the Work Session.

More than Just Carbon – 2018 Results and Highlights

Addressing climate action brings significant benefit to the community, including the following results:

- **Energy Policy 2018 results**
  - See Attachment 1 for the 2018 Energy Policy Annual Update infographic.
  - Top highlights:
    - Time of Day rates for all residential electric customers and Income Qualified Assistance Program for all utility services.
    - 100% Renewable electricity by 2030 Resolution
    - Ordinance establishing the Building Energy and Water Scoring program.
    - Winning the Bloomberg Philanthropies Mayors Challenge and $1M award for establishing the Epic Homes initiative.
  - Results from the 2018 efficiency programs show energy reductions equivalent to over 4,200 homes in our community by saving 32,800 megawatt-hours (2.1% of the community’s electricity use).
  - Solar installations continued at a rapid pace with over 350 new solar systems completed, adding 2,400 kilowatts of capacity.
  - Efficiency and solar programs generated in excess of $40 million in local economic benefits through reduced utility bills, direct rebates and leveraged investment, while supporting over 200 jobs.
  - New wind and solar resources provided via Platte River Power Authority will provide more than 50% of electricity from non-fossil resources by 2021.

- **Waste Materials:**
  - Collaborated successfully with regional partners to develop and begin implementing Larimer County master plan for new infrastructure that will help Fort Collins meet diversion goals.
  - Community diversion rates holding steady at 59% (overall), 28% (residential/commercial)
  - 58% increase in concrete recycling in 2018 (over 2017)
  - Recognized for most thorough tracking & reporting of industrial waste in the state

- **Transportation and Mobility:**
  - Went from funding one electric bus to pilot on the Transfort System back in 2018 to securing almost $6.3M in funding for seven electric buses that will be online by 2023.
  - Completed updates to City Plan, Transportation Master Plan, and the Transit Plan, which included a focus on climate action and will guide the community’s land use patterns over the next 20-30 years.
  - Completed the EV Readiness Roadmap, outlining short-term, medium-term and long-term strategies to become EV ready as a community.

- **Water:** Decreased per capita per day water use by 8% since 2005 and increased 1% over 2017.

- **Overall efforts and highlights:**
  - Continued to engage and diversify the CAP Community Advisory Committee, now representing over 20 community members across the triple bottom line and the triple helix.
  - Continued statewide and federal policy advocacy via Colorado Communities for Climate Action (CC4CA), a coalition of 27 Colorado counties and municipalities to protect Colorado’s climate for current and future generations, including the passage of over a dozen bills in the 2019 legislative
session in alignment with Fort Collins’ climate action goals. Legislative advocacy also included the Colorado Association of Municipal Utilities (CAMU) where specific utility issues were relevant.

- Completed the second round of the Innovate Fort Collins Challenge, which supported five external and seven internal projects that will pilot solutions to reduce emission though energy, waste reduction, and behavior change. 2018 projects reduced approximately 4,500 Metric Tons CO₂e.
- Launched the SHIFT campaign to engage residents with easy, simple and positive actions to save them time, money, and improve their health, all while positively impacting our climate action goals. Already hundreds of Fort Collin’s residents have pledged to take action.
- Launched Sustainable Neighborhoods Fort Collins, which includes four pilot neighborhoods across the community engaging in projects they design and select to increase their neighborhood’s sustainability.
- Initiated a partnership with Vila Nova de Famalicão via the European Union’s International Urban Cooperation Programme, with shared goals and focus around sustainable mobility, behavior change, and inclusive economic development.
- Staff continues to meet with interested businesses, community members and stakeholders and interacted with over 6,000 interactions with community members and approximately 350 interactions with business community members in 2018.
- Launched a grant-funded effort by the Urban Sustainability Directors Network in partnership with eight other U.S. cities to advance climate action planning work that centers planning and implementation in equity and includes both mitigation and resilience actions.

Local Action Makes a Difference

Staff and leadership are often asked about the difference local action makes in achieving the community’s climate action goals. A new analysis of drivers of electricity emissions has been completed (see Attachment 2). The analysis demonstrates how various factors have driven electricity emissions up, while City and partner efforts have brought them back down.

Key takeaways from the analysis include the following:

- Population growth and weather-related increases (34% increase since 2005) are offset by utility-scale investments (34% decrease since 2005).
- Local investments, including both energy efficiency and distributed energy resources, drive the 16% reduction in electricity emissions seen from 2005 - 2018. In other words, without local investments, energy emissions would have stayed flat and not decreased 16%.

Transitioning to 2030

Updating the Climate Action Plan, Energy Policy, and Road to Zero Waste Plan

Summary

In the 2019-2020 City Budget, two offers were funded

- Offer 43.10 – Road to Zero Waste Plan Update (funded via KFCG for $30K over two years)
- Offer 43.12 – 2030 Climate Action and Energy Policy Update – Optimizing Policy, Targets, and Strategies ($120K of funding over two years split between the General Fund and the Light and Power Fund)

Alignment

Updating these three plans aligns with the City’s Strategic Plan, Council Priorities, and City Plan (see Attachment 3 for full linkage):
Proposed Process

These three planning efforts will officially kickoff in the fall of 2019 and will run through 2020; all engagement efforts will be aligned (similar to the City Plan, Transportation Master Plan, and Transit Master Plan process) to allow residents and businesses streamlined and optimized engagement experiences. Adoption hearings are tentatively planned for Q4 of 2020.

Naming the Process: To ensure the planning process is accessible to the public, staff will be calling the combined effort of updating the three plans “Our Climate Future: Seeking equitable solutions to achieve energy, zero waste, and climate goals.”

Planning Phases: Three phases are proposed for the plan updates and are roughly outlined below

1. Understanding Community Priorities: Summer – Fall 2019
   - Purpose: Understand what residents and businesses care about most to ensure alignment of the Climate Action Plan, Energy Policy, and Road to Zero Waste Plans with community priorities.
   - Key Activities:
     - Initial Community Engagement (completed)
       - Visited with six stakeholder groups to begin co-creating the planning scope with the community, a key best practice from an equity perspective.
       - Results from this activity are described further below.
     - Initial Staff Analysis (currently underway)
       - Compile best practices from peer communities, as shared with the CAP CAC at their last meeting;
       - Conduct stakeholder mapping to understand the level of impact and influence of various stakeholders to prioritize initial engagement, e.g., how might we include indigenous
communities, people of color, low- and moderate-income community members, youth, and more within the planning processes; and

- Compile existing data to understand frontline communities most at-risk to climate change impacts and those impacted by existing inequities, e.g., housing affordability.
- Targeted Community Engagement (next steps)
  - Community listening sessions with prioritized stakeholder groups
  - Pop-up events, similar to those employed in Vila Nova de Famalicão, e.g., “yellow couch,” to meet people where they are
  - Development of community partners and plan ambassadors’ program to help facilitate these conversations (similar to City Plan)
- Engagement Plan for the Formal Planning Process, which will be posted online for the community to provide feedback

  - Outcomes: Engagement Plan, Summary of Community Priorities, Plan Ambassadors and Community Partners selected, trained and leading discussions

2. Formal Planning: Fall 2019 – Summer 2020

  - Purpose: Leveraging the community priorities from Phase One, this phase will include the more traditional components of a planning process and will result in a draft plan.
  - Key Activities:
    - Data collection and analysis, e.g., apply an equity lens to existing CAP strategies and new strategies identified through Phase One (both via community engagement and best practices research)
    - Coordination with preliminary results and studies from the Platte River Power Authority Integrated Resources Plan (IRP), scheduled for completion in summer 2020.
    - Visioning and scenarios, e.g., community kickoff and engagement efforts to develop the vision and scenarios for the various plans; formation of working groups to dive more deeply into strategy development and scenario analysis.
    - Plan Development, including the drafting of the plan document(s)

  - Key Outcomes: Draft Plan(s), summary from various community engagement efforts

3. Plan(s) Release and Adoption: Fall – Winter 2020

  - Purpose: Ensure the community and leadership has enough time to review and provide input on the draft plan prior to adoption.
  - Key Activities:
    - Community dialogues, including a Work Session, to review the draft plan(s) as well as online public comment on the various strategies and metrics proposed for the processes.
    - Revisions as a result of this feedback, with documentation of what was done with the feedback.
    - Develop the final plan(s).

  - Key Outcomes: Final Plan(s), summary of community feedback

Results from Initial Community Engagement

Staff visited with numerous groups to gain a starting point for how these plans should engage the community:

- CAP Community Advisory Committee (February 7, 2019)
- Energy Board (March 14, 2019)
- Chamber Local Legislative Affairs Committee (April 19, 2019)
Youth Advisory Board (May 1, 2019)
Natural Resources Advisory Board (May 15, 2019)
Air Quality Advisory Board (June 17, 2019).
Note, in addition to these groups, staff also reviewed these themes with the North Fort Collins Business Association (May 22, 2019).

In each of these meetings, staff asked the groups the following questions:

- If the planning processes were successful, how would residents be engaged?
- If the planning processes were successful, how would businesses be engaged?
- If the planning processes were successful, how would initiatives be selected?

The feedback from these groups is summarized in Attachment 4, with the following highlights:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Overall Themes</th>
<th>More Specific Perspectives</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Planning Processes</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Understand the audience and go to them</td>
<td>Ensure a variety of community members are engaged in the process</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Who leads the engagement is just as important as the process</td>
<td>Peer to peer engagement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Planning Outcomes</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Match storytelling to the audience – ensure relevancy of the final plan</td>
<td>See businesses &amp; residents in the final plan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Show the benefits, both from a TBL perspective and from an individual lens</td>
<td>Beyond GHG reductions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Be transparent about the plan process</td>
<td>Illustrate residents &amp; businesses are being heard</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Final Plan Strategies</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Diversity / Variety of pathways</td>
<td>Honor community’s diversity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ROI and tradeoffs</td>
<td>Preference for voluntary strategies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strategies build in the dynamic nature of climate work</td>
<td>Be clear on who benefits and who does not</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Next Steps**

- **Our Climate Future (planning processes)**
  - Initiate the remaining activities associated with Phase One – Understanding Community Priorities.
  - Launch an OurCity webpage for residents to interact with the effort.
  - Develop structure for topic areas and associated working groups to begin formal planning and scenario analysis.
  - Define potential needs for consultants and community partners for technical analysis and/or engagement with stakeholders.

- **Overall**
  - Council will consider a Draft Resolution Acknowledging the Global Climate Emergency and Reaffirming Fort Collins’ Commitment to Local Action at the August 20 Regular Meeting.
  - At the May CAP Community Advisory Committee (CAC) meeting (see Attachment 5), members noted it is important for the CAP CAC to be as representative of Fort Collins as possible and that additional recruitment is important to ensure this representation. Before soliciting additional CAP CAC members, staff is first assessing the existing demographics of the CAC so that recruitment can be targeted to maximize representation.
  - Publish 2018 community carbon inventory report and send out press release.
  - Launch a fall SHIFT campaign with additional actions residents can take to make a difference and save time, money and improve their health.
ATTACHMENTS

1. Energy Policy 2018 Annual Update Infographic (PDF)
2. Local Action Makes a Difference: New Analysis Highlights Impact of Local Investments (PDF)
3. Our Climate Future - Linkage with City's Strategic Plan, Council Priorities, and City Plan (PDF)
4. Overall Engagement Themes (PDF)
5. May Climate Action Plan Community Advisory Committee Notes (PDF)
6. PowerPoint Presentation (PDF)
Energy Policy Report
2018 Annual Update

We can lead in ENERGY EFFICIENCY and RENEWABLES with HIGH RELIABILITY, AFFORDABLE BILLS and AWARD-WINNING PROGRAMS.

The Energy Policy reflects Fort Collins’ values of reliability, affordability, safety, greenhouse gas emissions reduction, pollution prevention, environmental stewardship and energy independence. It is aligned with the Climate Action Plan (CAP) goals of 20% carbon reduction below 2005 levels by 2020, 80% by 2030 and carbon neutral by 2050.

How do you fit in?
COMMUNITY ENERGY USE
Per capita reductions from 2005

Electricity use per capita is the lowest it’s been since 1986.

Since 2005

POPULATION INCREASED

28%

ELECTRICITY AND NATURAL GAS USE INCREASED ONLY

11%

Thanks to residents and businesses improving efficiency and practicing conservation.

Building square footage increased by 21%, but buildings are 9% MORE EFFICIENT.

Our Impact

Despite a growing population, efficiency programs have helped limit the increase in electricity use. It would be 13% higher without Utilities’ programs.

Residential Efficiency Savings: 46M kWh

Business Efficiency Savings: 155M kWh

Saved Electricity from Efficiency

Actual Community Electricity Use

2005 2010 2015 2018

fcgov.com/what-we-do
Energy Efficiency
Customer electricity savings from efficiency programs totaled 32.8M kWh (2.1% of the community’s annual use), equivalent to taking 4,200 homes off the grid.

The average residential customer uses about 650 kWh per month (or 7,800 kWh per year).

Reliability
With 99.997% reliability, most residents did not experience an outage.

Community Economics
Customer projects generated $40M in local economic benefits through reduced utility bills, direct rebates and leveraged investments, and also supported 200+ JOBS.

Peak Usage
Fort Collins Utilities customers reduced demand by 2,000+ kW during peak times.

Did you Know?
It is cheaper to save electricity with efficiency (3.4 cents) than it is to buy more electricity (6.1 cents).

Energy Carbon Emissions
Down 16% from 2005

Electricity Supply
2005 2018
76% Fossil Fuels 67% Fossil Fuels
22% Hydro 19% Hydro
2% Wind 11% Wind
0% Solar 3% Solar

1.2% of electricity came from local renewables.

Local Solar
Installed 350+ new rooftop solar systems, adding 2,400 kW, a 20% increase in total capacity from 2017.

Rates
Residential rates are approximately 32% less than those for the average Colorado electric customer.

LOOKING FORWARD
Vision: Fort Collins is a leader in the transition to sustainable and resilient local energy systems.

Utility
Advanced Energy Distribution System

Community
Efficient, smart, connected buildings

New resources by 2020
20,000 kW solar
165,000 kW wind
2,000 kWh battery storage
Local Action Makes a Difference: New Analysis Highlights Impact of Local Investments

Background: As mentioned previously, one of the central questions around the climate action plan is what difference our local actions are making. In the past, it has been difficult to pull apart the specific impact of drivers like growth and weather or national and regional policy from our local programs and policies. In 2018, staff developed a contribution analysis for the drivers of electricity emissions, see Figure 1 below. The analysis looks at each major contributing factor between 2005 and 2017 for this emissions category. In 2019, staff is working to create the same analysis for the inventory overall.

Key Takeaways:
- Population growth and weather-related increases (34% increase since 2005) are offset by utility-scale investments (34% decrease since 2005).
- Local investments, including both energy efficiency and distributed energy resources, drive the 16% reduction in electricity emissions seen from 2005 - 2018. In other words, without local investments, energy emissions would have stayed flat and not decreased 16%.

![Drivers of Change in Electricity GHG Emissions Between 2005 and 2018](chart)

Figure 1: This chart shows how factors such as growth and weather increase electricity emissions and how Platte River Power Authority’s operations and increasing renewable electricity resources and the City’s efficiency and solar programs have more than countered population growth and weather.

Interpretation and Analysis: This graph is read left to right, beginning with the 2005 baseline column on the far left. Each column from moving toward the center of the graph is a driver that has increased electricity emissions between 2005 and 2017. From the center line moving to the right, each column represents a driver that has decreased these emissions between 2005 and 2017.
- Increasing factors:
  - Growth bundles several types of growth, including population and commercial activity.
  - Weather represents emissions increases due to additional electricity used in response to weather.
- Decreasing factors:
  - Utility-scale investments represents changes in operations and increasing renewable electricity resources made by Platte River Power Authority to lower the emissions intensity of electricity generation.
  - Local represents City energy programs, focused primarily on energy efficiency and solar generation.
## Our Climate Future: Linkage with City’s Strategic Plan, Council Priorities, and City Plan

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Document</th>
<th>Linkage</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Strategic Plan</td>
<td>4.1 Achieve Climate Action Plan (CAP) 2020 goals and continue progress toward 2030 goals</td>
<td>Planning efforts will focus on the 2030 CAP goals and outline a pathway / pathways for achieving them.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4.3 Achieve 2020 Energy Policy goals and work towards Climate Action goals for carbon neutrality</td>
<td>Planning efforts will build upon the 2020 Energy Policy and establish priorities, pathways and targets for the energy sector (electricity and natural gas) to 2030 and beyond.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4.4 Achieve the 2020 Road to Zero Waste goals and work toward the 2030 zero waste goals</td>
<td>These planning efforts will revisit waste reduction goals in alignment with new regional infrastructure, emerging technology, and changing global recycling markets to develop strategies and pathways to the 2030 zero waste goal.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4.5 Develop strategies to improve the community’s climate resiliency</td>
<td>These planning efforts will establish strategies and metrics to support the community’s climate resilience. Staff is also working closely with Larimer County to ensure alignment with their planning efforts and programs and to partner when possible, e.g., Hazard Mitigation Planning.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Council Priorities</td>
<td>Equity and Inclusion</td>
<td>The planning efforts will be centered in equity for process and outcomes:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Process: Staff will be seeking ways to ensure there are opportunities for all residents and businesses to have meaningful opportunities to participate in the planning process in order to co-create policies, tools, and programs that work for our community.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Outcomes: Ensuring the strategies in the final plan allow everyone in Fort Collins to benefit from carbon neutrality.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Community Engagement</td>
<td>Building off the successes of City Plan, staff will explore unique and innovative engagement approaches, including storytelling, working with community partners and ambassadors to let the community lead portions of the engagement process, and going to community members instead of simply asking them to come to the City. More information in Attachment 4.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Air Quality</td>
<td>Working on climate resilience aligns with the Council’s air quality priorities, as many climate solutions, e.g., reducing transportation emissions, benefit air quality concerns, e.g., ozone.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Infrastructure</td>
<td>A key element of the planning processes will be identifying the infrastructure needs, e.g., advanced electric distribution grid systems, needed to deliver upon the 2030 climate action goals.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>City Plan</td>
<td><strong>Principle ENV 2: Become a carbon neutral community by 2050 and improve the community’s resilience to prepare for and adapt to the impacts of climate change.</strong> Planning processes will follow Policy ENV 2.1 which calls for a balance of affordability, reliability, and sustainability as well as Policy ENV 2.2 which calls on the City to integrate mitigation and resilience actions in our work.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Principle ENV 3: Transition from fossil to renewable energy systems.</strong> Planning processes will outline a strategy for achieving the community’s 100% Renewable Electricity Goal (Policy ENV 3.1), support improving the energy efficiency of new and existing buildings (Policy ENV 3.2) and accelerate the beneficial electrification of buildings and transportation (Policy ENV 3.3).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Principle ENV 5: Create a Zero Waste system</strong> Beginning with Reduce, Reuse, and Refuse (Policy ENV 5.1), the plans will align with the regional wasteshed efforts (Policy ENV 5.2) and continue to identify strategies for landfill diversion (Policy ENV 5.3).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Principle T 9: Utilize the transportation system to support a healthy and equitable community.</strong> The plans will emphasize transportation and mobility solutions that support CAP and GHG reduction goals (Policy T 9.9) and improve air quality (Policy T 9.8).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Principle HI 3: Provide opportunities for meaningful and inclusive community involvement in governance and decision-making.</td>
<td>The plans will employ a range of engagement approaches (Policy HI 3.3), seek to be more inclusive (Policy HI 3.4) and provide opportunities to engage with the plans in other languages (Policy HI 3.6).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Initial Community Engagement Feedback  
Climate Action Plan, Energy Policy Road to Zero Waste Scoping  
Updated July 2, 2019

Description
In 2019 thru 2020, staff will be updating the Climate Action Plan, Energy Policy and Road to Zero Waste Plans in alignment with Platte River’s Integrated Resource Plan update. Staff visited with

Staff visited with numerous groups to gain a starting point for how these plans should engage the community:
• CAP Community Advisory Committee (February 7, 2019)
• Energy Board (March 14, 2019)
• Chamber Local Legislative Affairs Committee (April 19, 2019)
• Youth Advisory Board (May 1, 2019)
• Natural Resources Advisory Board (May 15, 2019)
• Air Quality Advisory Board (June 17, 2019)
• Note: staff also reviewed these themes with the North Fort Collins Business Association (May 22, 2019).

In each of these meetings, staff asked the group’s the following questions:
• If the planning processes were successful, how would residents be engaged?
• If the planning processes were successful, how would businesses be engaged?
• If the planning processes were successful, how would initiatives be selected?

The feedback from these groups is summarized in the pages below, and the full feedback will be available on the project’s website once established.

Planning Process Themes

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Overall Themes</th>
<th>Supporting Points</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Understand the audience and go to them</td>
<td>• Identify demographics and stakeholder groups throughout the process, e.g., statistically valid surveys, engagement events, residents and businesses, etc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Work with the community to employ a variety of engagement methods, e.g., social media, theater ads, direct mail, pop-up events in specific areas of interests (EVs, Transit, via smart phone), on-site interviews, schools, picnics, startup week, etc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Make it Fun and Easy! Consider tours, field trips, demonstrations, neighborhood competitions, hosting BBQs, opportunities for minimal effort to engage, etc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Always communicate a compelling and accessible “why” tailored to your audience (vision, make the goals real, have milestones, what does no action look like, etc.)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Ensure that if we’re asking, we’re clear on how the feedback will impact the process, i.e., Illustrate how community engagement influenced final outcomes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Who Leads the Engagement is Just as Important as the Process</td>
<td>• When should the City lead versus just be present? Leverage and build upon techniques from City Plan, e.g., ambassadors and community partners, and other leading-edge techniques, such as meetings in other languages.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Include diverse perspectives from residents and businesses:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>o Community members - consider race, ethnicity, age, class, disabilities, veterans, LGBTQ+, income, renters, etc.; engage community leaders</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>o Businesses – Size, industry/sector, revenue, location, minority-owned and women-owned, sustainability coordinators, facility managers, and owners, etc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Every engagement opportunity is an opportunity to build trust</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Bring in local, lived experience experts at the right times, from school ambassadors to local contractors and small business owners</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Planning Outcome Themes

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Overall Themes</th>
<th>Supporting Points</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Match storytelling to the audience – ensure relevancy of the final plan | • People and businesses need to see themselves in the final plan  
  o Impacts need to be relatable and localized  
  o Communicate how individual actions add up to collective impact  
  • Communicate in multiple languages and cultural contexts  
  • Always communicate a compelling and accessible "why"  
  • Illustrate how the City is leading by example |
| Show the benefits and costs, both from a triple bottom line perspective and from an individual lens | • Communicate benefits to businesses and community members beyond greenhouse gas reductions, i.e., align with their existing values, help make the case  
  • Be transparent about true costs to businesses and community members of action and non-action  
  • Consider affordability impacts  
  • Communicate contingency if plan is not achieved |
| Be transparent about the plan process               | • Document and make available notes and feedback from process  
  • Tell the story of the plan itself |

### Final Plan Strategies

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Overall Themes</th>
<th>Supporting Points</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Diversity / Variety of pathways                    | • Strategies honor business and community member diversity, accessibility, and disproportionate impact  
  o Sector specific, demographics, barriers to action, e.g., engage DBA on recycling issues, landlords and renters on building issues, property managers, etc.  
  • Preference for voluntary and optional strategies vs. mandates  
  • Variety of strategies to influence change  
  o Training/Education/technical assistance; infrastructure, incentives, regulatory options  
  o Consider strategies that balance out where community members and businesses are starting (easy, simple actions) with those that have more significant impact – need for both  
  • Communicate multiple levels of influence – local, regional, state, federal, international, etc.  
  • Consider where incentives are best directed, e.g., customer versus installer, business vs community member, etc.  
  • Allow people the opportunity to prioritize strategies |
| ROI and tradeoffs                                  | • Spell out the cost effectiveness of various strategies and follow up to confirm  
  • Be clear on who benefits and who does not - tradeoffs/tensions, e.g., electrification  
  • Use a triple bottom line lens to assess impacts and assess feasibility  
  • Ensure balance between mitigation impacts, resilience, and equity, e.g., leveraging private capital can favor the affluent, can multi-modal transportation be cheaper than owning two cars? |
| Strategies build in the dynamic nature of climate work | • Flexibility for rapidly evolving technology, e.g., net zero housing, shifting heating loads, microgrids, smart phones & integrated mobility platforms, etc.  
  • Adaptability for state, federal, or international policy  
  • How/when to consider lifecycle costs |
Climate Action Plan - Community Advisory Committee
May 30, 2019 12:00 – 2:30 pm
300 Laporte – CIC Room

**Anticipated Meeting Results: CAC Members will...**
- Continue getting to know each other and understand the impact of the CAC’s work
- Be introduced to the City’s work to date on equity and inclusion and begin developing a shared understanding of terms in this space
- Leverage best practices from other communities and feedback from community engagement to date, discuss and offer feedback to staff on how to lead with equity in the updates to the CAP/EP/RTZW planning efforts with community engagement, as a City, and in the CAC

**Attendees:**
**CAC Members (attendees in bold):**
- Stacey Baumgarn, Colorado State University
- Rose Lew, Fort Collins Sustainability Group
- Evelyn Carpenter, Solas Energy Consulting
- Todd Dangerfield, Downtown Development Authority
- Scott Denning, Colorado State University
- Javier Echeverria Diaz – Motherlove Herbal Company and farmer
- Ann Hutchinson, Fort Collins Area Chamber
- Fred Kirsch, Community for Sustainable Energy
- Steve Kuehneman, CARE Housing
- Lisa Leveillee, First National Bank
- Ben Lucas – Learfield/Colorado State University
- Sheble McConnellogue, Northern Colorado Clean Cities
- Molly McLaughlin, Colorado State University
- Dawn Paepke, Kaiser Permanente
- Todd Parker, Brinkman Development
- Amanda Probst – Homeschool mom
- Jean Runyon, Front Range Community College
- Patrick Shyvers – Advanced Micro Devices
- Bruno Sobral, One Health Institute, CSU
- Dimitris Stevis – Colorado State University
- Trudy Trimbath, Poudre School District
- Dana Villeneuve, New Belgium Brewing

**Staff Members:** Lindsay Ex, Janet Freeman, Molly Saylor, Jensen Morgan, Jeff Mihelich, John Phelan, Lucinda Smith, Carolyn Conant, Honoré Depew, Katy McLaren, Pete Iengo

**Facilitators:** Chris Hutchison, Diana Hutchinson

**Community members:** Dale Adamy, Nick Michell

**Notes**

**Introductions and Updates (Inform)**
*(Chris Hutchison, Lindsay Ex, CAC Members)*
- Introductions, purpose and ground rules reminder and additions for this meeting
  - Lindsay noted that, to our knowledge, while other plans have embedded equity into their work at the City, e.g., City Plan, FoCo Creates, this is the first time we'll be comprehensively leading with equity. This of course means we'll be on the leading edge, so we'll make mistakes and we'll need the CAC more than ever to help point these out to staff and help us all learn together in this space
Lindsay highlighted some of the impacts based on previous CAC meetings
Some CAC members were involved in the design meeting for the CAC meeting

**Equity and Inclusion – Overall Terms and the City’s work in this space (Inform) (Janet Freeman, CAC Members)**

- **Purpose:** Gain exposure via an overview of what is meant by equity and inclusion from a local government perspective and an introduction to what the City and community have already done in the equity space, and where this work is heading
  - Equity vs. Equality definition
  - City striving to have support to attain equitable outcomes.
  - Racism – need to name the problem to be able to address it. Example of #MeToo movement as a way to highlight an old challenge that is now being talked about more.
  - Focusing on making improvements for one or two dimensions, such as a race, will have benefits for other marginalized groups.
  - CAC comment: It can be hard to see what the City is doing for internal quality of work environment vs. what they are saying citizens should be doing, especially on the website. Would be helpful to clarify.
  - CAC question: If we say we are centering this work with race, does that mean we stop working on the other dimensions of diversity?
    - Lindsay: No, not all (and Janet referred the group back to the City’s Strategic Plan which specifically highlights other dimensions of diversity). Instead, what we’re learning from other cities and best practices in this space is that if we lead with race, it’s the most inclusive way to address the other dimensions of diversity. But it’s really an “and,” we keep doing the important work to address all dimensions of diversity, including race, income, gender, etc.
  - CAC question: on the equity service slide, it notes equitable treatment – how is that different than equitable outcomes?
    - Janet: Noted that it’s about process and outcomes. Can clarify if helpful moving forward.

**CAP CAC Group discussion:**

- **What are the key differences between individual, institutional, and structural racism?**
  - Institutional/structural racism have stronger power and greater reach than individual
  - There is a reinforcing cycle. For example, we have a structure of charter schools, within which individuals can make choices to attend a school, which reinforces the segregation / racism.
  - Focus on just race can leave out other important dimensions. What about the socio-economic area? It seems like this is a bigger area in Fort Collins.

- **What examples of the following policies and biases have you or your stakeholders observed within City government or in our community?**
  - Institutional/explicit (policies which explicitly discriminate against a group)
    - U+2 – explicit institutional discrimination based on family stats
  - Institutional/implicit (policies that negatively impact one group unintentionally)
    - Housing vouchers (section 8) – can be both structural and individual
    - Hiring practices can be at all levels
    - Electricity Time of Day – A CAC member asked about whether the TOD rates were analyzed for potential negative impacts to specific customer segments.
  - Individual/explicit (prejudice in action – discrimination)
  - Individual/implicit (unconscious attitudes and beliefs)
    - Housing vouchers (section 8) – can be both structural and individual
    - Hiring practices can be at all levels
    - City staffer making derogatory comments about an older car, implied judgement about economic class
Applying Equity and Inclusion to the Climate Action Plan/Energy Policy/Road to Zero Waste Planning Processes and the CAC Going Forward (Involve)

(Lindsay, Molly Saylor, John Phelan, Honoré Depew, CAC Members)

- Reviewed best practices for embedding equity and inclusion into climate action efforts from cities across the U.S. and globally. Shared the major themes from community engagement efforts to date

- **CAP CAC Group discussion:**
  - *Where do we see ourselves now with our climate action efforts – within the community, the City, as a CAC?*
    - Community is high support, moderate awareness, low action
    - Kudos to CAC group for calling out need for Spanish-language focus
    - Gentrification occurring, this is related to CAP (if you can’t live here, then you increase vehicle miles traveled and transportation costs and emissions)
    - Climate Action planning is pretty well baked in at City level, CAC has been raising questions about equity. But at community level, realize that not everyone is at the same level of awareness of Climate Action Plan, for example those who recently moved here. Need to continue viewing this work as new when in the community.
    - Some of strategies can be elitist/different impact to different people in community.
    - Are we “bolting” equity onto CAP? Or are we really leading with equity?
    - Some people say, “it doesn’t matter, I’ll just pay more. Others need to make changes.”
    - Is riding the bus an opportunity or a punishment for those who don’t have other options? Can be both, e.g., going from CSU to downtown or vice versa.
    - Additional notes from facilitators and/or follow-up emails:
      - Recognition that the community is in a good place for moving forward with policies related to climate action and being more inclusive
      - Discussed that there are significant perceptions about imbalance in the community, e.g., northern schools versus southern schools
      - Acknowledged that the City is really walking the walk in this space
      - Messaging has been challenging but is improving
        - Noted that with Take Two, struggled with translations to all populations – great to see this changing with Shift
      - Need for more focus on individual benefits
      - The current climate action plan is strong. Perhaps we can just keep the overall plan and analyze the strategies with an equity lens. The current strategies disproportionately affect the people in our community.
  
- *With what we now know, what do we want to do with our climate action efforts moving forward - within the community; within the City; as a CAC?*
  - Bake equity into CAP to make sure it is integrated in rather than added on. (example of quality of bike lanes added in vs. designed in). We might need to completely rethink how we do things from the very beginning.
  - Find where people go anyway and meet them there to communicate with them or get their inputs. Map groups/segments within our community – where do they worship, eat, work, etc.
  - Go back through current strategies with an equity lens.
  - Increase diversity in room of CAC to get more voices.
  - Get data to evaluate how effective we are with programs we already have (i.e. community solar – how inclusive is that? It seems more inclusive, but is it? Again recognizing all dimensions of diversity)
  - Reframe: Climate action = Opportunity
  - We don’t want to lose that we are still trying to reduce GHGs, even as we bring in equity; don’t want people to think we have given up if we talk about adaptation and resilience.
For example, there are ambitious goals around energy efficiency and main focus has been most GHG reduced for the buck...if they are reframed around being more equitable, are we okay with evaluating the goals? How will we navigate this tension?

- Who defines metrics and indicators around equity? How do we get common definitions and understanding? Can we involve our community in defining these metrics and indicators of equity in our community.
- Look at Portland model shifting who/what is at the center and what is serving that. Affordability, safety, health became central rather than peripheral.
- Use an equity tool to figure out the right questions to ask.
- Additional notes from facilitators and/or follow-up emails:
  - Increase outreach to school, e.g., a month-long challenge
  - How can we make existing programs more accessible, e.g., CityWorks and similar programs
  - How do leverage neighborhoods in the equity and resilience space. Neighbors are the “true first responders” to any situation. Can we increase capacity of Sustainable Neighborhoods? This is a great program!
  - Who is speaking is just as important as what is being said (with regards to CAP and community engagement)
  - At minimum, cause no harm with new actions; be careful not to incentivize actions that could have unintended consequences
  - Bring in guest speakers to CAC to hear different voices/perspectives
  - Gain more clarity around expectations of how CAP/EP/RTZW update will impact racial equity – it probably won’t solve it

Next Steps (Collaborate)
(Chris Hutchinson, Lindsay Ex, CAC Members)

- Continue
  - Reminder/focus on why we are here
  - Facilitation by city staff in small groups
  - Opportunity for communication with each other
  - Hearing about what impacts we have made in previous CAC meetings
  - Prework was helpful. Continue case studies from other cities.
  - Involving CAC members in pre-design

- Stop/Start (Change)
  - Better sticky pads
  - More discussion on how much racism is a proxy for other kinds of discrimination like economic, general questioning in this space and need to bring additional data to the table.
  - Relationship of this to waste program
  - Guest speakers from other impacted communities/get other diverse perspectives
  - Explicit stories, for example where the City found explicit racism and resolved it
  - Hear about other opportunities to discuss these topics beyond quarterly CAC meetings
  - Close the loop on this topic

- Q3 2019 Meeting Preview - will do a doodle poll as the original date needs to change. Topic will be announced based on group priorities.
1. Does Council have feedback on the proposed community engagement?

2. Does Council have feedback on the proposed planning process?
Climate Action Plan Goals

Where are we going?

CLIMATE GOALS

2005

DOWN 17% 2020

2017 INVENTORY 17% BELOW 2005

2030

80% REDUCTION

2050

CARBON NEUTRAL BY 2050

20% REDUCTION
Fort Collins Climate Commitment

- First commitment in 1999
- Fort Collins is well-positioned to demonstrate carbon neutrality
  - Utility
  - Partnerships
  - Innovation Economy
- Local action on a global issue
  - Understand global risk
  - Act with local solutions
  - Lead by example

11,700

2016 - 2018 ENERGY EFFICIENCY SAVINGS ALONE

INCREASED MOMENTUM FROM PLATTE RIVER. PARTNER CITIES, AND STATEWIDE
Drivers of Change in Electricity GHG Emissions Between 2005 and 2018

Takeaways:
Population growth and weather-related increases (34%) are offset by utility-scale investments (34%).

Local investments drive the 16% reduction in electricity emissions seen from 2005 - 2018.

Note: The full inventory analysis is underway, this illustrates drivers of change for electricity and natural gas only.
**ELECTRICITY**
- 100% Renewable Electricity by 2030
- Platte River: 100% non-carbon
  - Over 50% renewable by 2021!
- 20% increase in local solar capacity

**MOBILITY**
- Seven electric buses by 2023 ($6.3M)
- Alignment with City Plan
- 2X transit ridership in 4 years
- EV Readiness Roadmap

**NATURAL GAS**
- Emissions increase continue
- Key opportunity for planning processes

**WASTE MATERIALS**
- Regional Wastedh
- Passed Ordinance enabling Construction & Demolition Facility

And the municipal organization met its goal 3 years ahead of time!
2018 Highlights

FC Bikes
June 26 at 1:03 PM

At Open Streets on June 16, City of Fort Collins - Government SHIFT campaign had a bike to give away. Congratulations to Jude who won the bike. When the bike was delivered, the SHIFT team discovered that it was Jude's mother's birthday. Jude turned right around and gave the bike he just won to his mom for her birthday!

Sustainable Neighborhoods: Oakridge 8 Tree Planting Event

Shift Campaign Pledge Winner
OUR CLIMATE FUTURE

Seeking equitable solutions to achieve energy, zero waste, and climate goals.
Transition to 2030: Our Climate Future

OUR CLIMATE FUTURE

INCLUDES UPDATES TO:

Climate Action Plan
Energy Policy
Road to Zero Waste Plan
Evolving Approach

Can we?
Individual plans and engagement
Focus on reducing emissions
Recognized infrastructure needs
Largely technical analyses

How can we?
Combined process
Resilience, equity and reducing
Infrastructure and sequencing
Engagement + Technical

Plans will align timeframes, community engagement, and be explicit about tradeoffs
**Guiding Theme: Equity**

- **Equity** = Process and outcome both

- **Process** = ensures opportunities for all to co-create policies, tools and programs

- **Outcome** = everyone benefits from a carbon neutral Fort Collins
Phases for Update of Plan(s)

1. Understanding Community Priorities
   - Summer - Fall 2019

2. Formal Planning
   - Fall 2019 - Summer 2020
   - Data Collection & Analysis
   - Visioning
   - Scenarios
   - Plan Development

3. Plan Release and Adoption
   - Fall - Winter 2020

Notes: (1) Target timeline for adoption in Q4 2020; (2) Staff anticipates this timeline will shift, depending on findings at each stage.
## Community Outreach to Date

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Overall Themes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Planning Processes</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| • Understand the audience and go to them  
• Who leads engagement is just as important as process |
| **Planning Outcomes** |
| • Match storytelling to the audience – ensure relevancy  
• Show the benefits: Both TBL and Individual Lens  
• Be transparent about the plan process |
| **Final Plan Strategies** |
| • Diversity / Variety of pathways  
• ROI and tradeoffs – be clear who benefits and who does not  
• Strategies build in the dynamic nature of climate work |

Includes: Air Quality Advisory Board, CAP Community Advisory Committee, Chamber Local Legislative Affairs Committee, Energy Board, Natural Resources Advisory Board, North Fort Collins Business Association, and Youth Advisory Board
Community Outreach Moving Forward

- OurCity Website
- Compiling best practices
- Stakeholder mapping
  - Prioritizing traditionally underrepresented, including:
    - Indigenous communities,
    - People of color,
    - Low and moderate income,
    - Youth, etc.
- Targeted community engagement
  - Community listening sessions
  - Pop-up events
Next Steps

• Our Climate Future
  • Community Outreach
  • OurCity Website
  • Develop structure and working group for specific topic areas

• Overall
  • Climate Emergency Resolution (Aug 20)
  • Fall SHIFT campaign
  • 2018 Community Carbon Inventory Report
  • CAP Community Advisory Committee Recruitment
1. Does Council have feedback on the proposed community engagement?

2. Does Council have feedback on the proposed planning process?
Phase 1: Understanding Community Priorities

Notes:
a) This looks linear – it’s not
b) Lots of concurrent work: Our City Website, Additional Trainings, Engagement tracking database, File structure and data sharing, etc.
c) Compile best practices from mitigation/resilience lens and considering residents and businesses, all from an equity lens
Implementation Infrastructure

- Unprecedented, cross-functional team
- 70 staff members, over 30 community members
- Driven by Community and Council vision
- Engagement at all levels
- Triple Bottom Line community engagement