



Doug Ernest, Acting Chair
Meg Dunn
Bud Frick
Kristin Gensmer
Per Hogestad
Dave Lingle
Alexandra Wallace
Belinda Zink

City Council Chambers
City Hall West
300 Laporte Avenue
Fort Collins, Colorado

Cablecast on FCTV Channel 14 and
881 (HD) on the Comcast cable system

The City of Fort Collins will make reasonable accommodations for access to City services, programs, and activities and will make special communication arrangements for persons with disabilities. Please call 221-6515 (TDD 224-6001) for assistance.

Regular Meeting December 14, 2016 Minutes

- **CALL TO ORDER**

Acting Chair Ernest called the meeting to order at 5:32 p.m.

- **ROLL CALL**

PRESENT: Dunn, Zink, Hogestad, Wallace, Gensmer, Ernest, Frick
ABSENT: Lingle
STAFF: McWilliams, Bzdek, Bumgarner, Yatabe, Schiager

- **AGENDA REVIEW**

No changes to posted agenda.

- **STAFF REPORTS**

Ms. McWilliams informed the Commission that the E. A. Schlichter House has officially been placed on the National Register of Historic Places.

Ms. Dunn gave a brief report about an open house the Loveland Historic Preservation Commission hosted at the Pulliam Community Building.

- **PUBLIC COMMENT ON ITEMS NOT ON THE AGENDA**

None.

- **DISCUSSION AGENDA**

1. CONSIDERATION AND APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF THE NOVEMBER 9, 2016 REGULAR MEETING.

The purpose of this item is to approve the minutes from the November 9, 2016 regular meeting of the Landmark Preservation Commission.

Ms. Dunn moved that the Landmark Preservation Commission approve the Minutes of the November 9, 2016 regular meeting as presented.

Mr. Hogestad & Mr. Frick recused themselves having been absent from the November 9th meeting.

Ms. Gensmer seconded. The motion passed 5-0.

ITEMS 2-5, LANDMARK DESIGNATIONS

[Secretary's Note: Agenda Items #2-5, all Landmark Designation applications put forward by Housing Catalyst, were initially presented and discussed together, prior to being discussed and deliberated individually.]

Staff Report

Ms. Bumgarner presented a staff report covering all four properties under consideration, providing background on the properties and the basis for their designations.

Applicant Presentation

Darcy McClure, Project Manager for Housing Catalyst (formerly the Housing Authority), briefly addressed the Commission. She explained that Housing Catalyst is going through this process as required by HUD prior to selling the properties, as they are potentially eligible for the National Register of Historic Places.

Staff Response

Staff had no additional information.

Public Input

None

Commission Questions and Discussion

Acting Chair Ernest mentioned that all four of the properties had been rentals, which is important to the history of Fort Collins as a college town, which did not initially have dormitories. Ms. Wallace mentioned that these simple properties exemplify the historic community, and the fact that their integrity is intact elevates their eligibility. Mr. Hogestad asked for confirmation that all four properties were possibly eligible for the National Register, even with the modifications. Ms. McWilliams explained that one was found to be individually eligible, and the others were found to be contributing to larger historic districts.

Mr. Hogestad questioned these buildings were really eligible from a design and materials standpoint, due to the significant modifications, specifically mentioning the garage door, awning and siding at 717 West Mulberry Street. Ms. Dunn said the modifications seemed to be easily reversible. Mr. Hogestad pointed out that the condition of the underlying materials was not known. Ms. McWilliams noted that staff had evaluated the properties in conjunction with inventories prepared by a consultant, and explained that there was a preponderance of integrity of materials, design, and each of the other

aspects of integrity. She also pointed out that a property doesn't have to meet all seven of the aspects of integrity in order to be eligible. Mr. Hogestad questioned whether materials should be included, but stated he could likely support the others.

Acting Chair Ernest acknowledged there may not be a preponderance of integrity to support materials and workmanship, but stated that at least five aspects of integrity are in place, which would be enough to qualify.

Mr. Hogestad also expressed concerns about setting since these properties weren't originally set on four or eight-lane arterials, but stated there was still enough integrity under the other aspects to support designation. Acting Chair Ernest pointed out that most streets were originally gravel, so if the street materials and width were considered part of setting, few properties would meet that standard. Mr. Hogestad agreed that it is rare to have the setting preserved and suggested that is what makes setting special. Ms. Zink said there wasn't much information presented about the setting of these properties, noting that the surrounding neighborhood is an important aspect of setting. Ms. Wallace commented that enough of the setting is preserved since these are still in a residential area, and added that the community is continually changing, so nothing would be in an untouched setting. Mr. Hogestad argued that Mountain Avenue as an example of an area where the setting has been preserved. He said he supports designating these properties, but thinks it important to specify that they do not meet all seven standards.

Acting Chair Ernest suggested the motion-maker include whatever standards they wish, and then the vote would determine whether that was supported. Mr. Yatabe mentioned that the discussion so far had largely grouped all of the properties together, and suggested expressing specific concerns related to each individual property.

2. 717 - 717 1/2 WEST MULBERRY STREET - APPLICATION FOR FORT COLLINS LANDMARK DESIGNATION

PROJECT DESCRIPTION: This item is to consider the request for a recommendation to City Council regarding landmark designation for The Wilhelm Property, a 1948 transitional ranch-style residence and attached garage at 717 and 717 ½ West Mulberry Street.

OWNER/APPLICANT: Housing Authority of the City of Fort Collins
1715 W Mountain Avenue, Fort Collins, CO 80521

Commission Questions and Discussion – All properties

Mr. Hogestad noted that his earlier comments about the garage and materials were specifically related to this property.

Ms. Dunn stated there is a preponderance of original materials, and that with regard to setting, while the street had changed, the surrounding homes were largely intact.

Commission Deliberation

Ms. Dunn moved that the Landmark Preservation Commission pass a resolution recommending that City Council designate the Wilhelm Property at 717 and 717½ West Mulberry Street as a Fort Collins Landmark in accordance with Municipal Code Chapter 14, based on the property's significance under Standard C as an example of an early transitional ranch dwelling with good exterior integrity based on all seven aspects of integrity.

Ms. Zink seconded.

Mr. Hogestad stated he would not support the motion based on his earlier comments. Mr. Frick suggested a friendly amendment to remove the materials. Ms. Dunn would like to have a vote based on the current motion, arguing that if the siding were removed, the original materials would still be underneath. Mr. Hogestad said there's no way of knowing whether the underlying materials are all intact. Ms. McWilliams explained that while the consultant's report seemed to suggest that the original materials were intact, it did not address Mr. Hogestad's specific concerns. She went on to suggest that the motion could be changed to remove the phrase "based on all seven aspects of integrity" at the end. Ms. Dunn agreed to that change, and Ms. Zink seconded.

Mr. Hogestad said this discussion was important in order to ensure that the Commission is consistent and equitable about preservation issues.

The motion passed 7:0.

3. 701 MATHEWS - APPLICATION FOR FORT COLLINS LANDMARK DESIGNATION

PROJECT DESCRIPTION: This item is to consider the request for a recommendation to City Council regarding landmark designation for The Schroeder/McMurry Property, a 1920 Craftsman-style bungalow and detached garage at 701 Mathews Street.

OWNER/APPLICANT: Housing Authority of the City of Fort Collins
1715 W Mountain Avenue, Fort Collins, CO 80521

Commission Questions and Discussion

The Members discussed possibilities as to the purpose of the chimney on the garage.

Acting Chair Ernest mentioned that the involvement of Montezuma Fuller adds some significance under Standard B.

Mr. Hogestad asked about the front entry and the parge coat on the foundation. Ms. McWilliams explained that the parge coat has likely been updated relatively recently. Mr. Hogestad commented that the entry piece looked out of place, and Mr. Frick suggested it may have been enclosed at some point. Mr. Hogestad added that it was a beautiful house with outstanding brick work. Ms. McWilliams drew the Commission's attention to the 1948 assessor's photo, which shows the entry substantially as it is now, other than the door. Ms. Zink said it also looked like the parge coat may have been in place at that time.

Ms. Gensmer said it meets all seven aspects of integrity, adding that the questions about the entryway and the parge coat had addressed her concerns.

Commission Deliberation

Ms. Gensmer moved the Landmark Preservation Commission pass a resolution recommending that City Council designate the Schroeder/McMurry Property at 701 Mathews Street as a Fort Collins Landmark in accordance with Municipal Code Chapter 14, based on the property's significance under Standard B for its association with builder H. W. Schroeder and architect Montezuma Fuller; and Standard C as an excellent example of a Craftsman-style residence and its exterior integrity based on all seven aspects of integrity.

Mr. Frick seconded. The motion passed 7-0.

4. 608 SOUTH GRANT AVENUE - APPLICATION FOR FORT COLLINS LANDMARK DESIGNATION

PROJECT DESCRIPTION: This item is to consider the request for a recommendation to City Council regarding landmark designation for The Kimball Property, a 1924 bungalow-style residence 608 and 608 ½ South Grant Avenue.

OWNER/APPLICANT: Housing Authority of the City of Fort Collins
1715 W Mountain Avenue, Fort Collins, CO 80521

Commission Questions and Discussion

Acting Chair Ernest mentioned that this property also appeared to have synthetic siding. Mr. Hogestad commented that the stair and railing appeared to have been altered.

Acting Chair Ernest mentioned the architecture, and noted the rear apartment from 1929. Members commented on how small the apartment looks from the outside.

Commission Deliberation

Ms. Dunn moved that the Landmark Preservation Commission pass a resolution recommending that City Council designate the Kimball Property at 608 and 608 ½ South Grant Avenue as a Fort Collins Landmark in accordance with Municipal Code Chapter 14, based on the property's significance under Standard C for its bungalow architectural style and its exterior integrity.

Ms. Wallace seconded. The motion passed 7-0.

5. 519 EAST MULBERRY STREET - APPLICATION FOR FORT COLLINS LANDMARK DESIGNATION

PROJECT DESCRIPTION: This item is to consider the request for a recommendation to City Council regarding landmark designation for The Howell Property, a 1908 hipped roof box type dwelling at 519 East Mulberry Street.

OWNER/APPLICANT: Housing Authority of the City of Fort Collins
1715 W Mountain Avenue, Fort Collins, CO 80521

Commission Questions and Discussion

Acting Chair Ernest commented about the siding and questioned whether it meets all aspects of exterior integrity.

Ms. Dunn mentioned that Mulberry is quite different now. Mr. Hogestad agreed, adding that this house would have originally had a large yard.

Mr. Hogestad asked if the siding was original, and Ms. McWilliams indicated that it was the same synthetic material the others had.

Commission Deliberation

Ms. Dunn moved that the Landmark Preservation Commission pass a resolution recommending that City Council designate the Howell Property at 519 East Mulberry Street as a Fort Collins Landmark in accordance with Municipal Code Chapter 14, based on the property's significance under Standard C and for its exterior integrity.

Ms. Gensmer seconded. The motion passed 7-0.

6. THE STANDARD - DEVELOPMENT REVIEW AND RECOMMENDATION TO THE PLANNING AND ZONING BOARD

PROJECT DESCRIPTION: The applicant is seeking a recommendation to the Planning and Zoning Board regarding the proposed design for a student housing project on West Prospect Road and Lake Street, east of Shields Street. The 4.23 acre development is comprised of two predominately 5-story buildings, one (Building A) facing Prospect Road and the other (Building B) facing Lake Street.

APPLICANT: Linda Ripley, Ripley Design, Inc.

Mr. Hogestad recused himself due to residing within the notification area for this project.

Mr. Frick said he had reviewed the videos of the discussions at the previous meetings had he missed and is prepared to participate.

Staff Report

Ms. McWilliams presented the staff report, including a slide presentation covering the background, role of the LPC, the criteria to be considered, the area of adjacency and a summary of recent design updates.

Applicant Presentation

Jay Silverman, Dwell Design Studio, introduced the Applicant team and gave a brief presentation. He quickly reviewed slides of the location, proposed site plan, aerial view and the design progression. He noted that the unit and bedroom count is slightly smaller now.

He provided an overview of the recent changes to the height, setback and width. He described how the stepback and slope height plane requirements have been addressed on both buildings.

Mr. Silverman talked about how the project and its design features meet the Land Use Code requirements in Section 3.4.7.F.2. He provided new perspectives of Building A, as requested previously by the Commission. He pointed out the changes to the exterior elevations of Building A, including modifications so that the parapets would not project into the slope height plane, modifications to the roof form, and the addition of more brick.

Mr. Silverman discussed the changes to Building B with regard to a stepback on the side, and updates to the landscaping and streetscapes.

Mr. Silverman described the materials to be used, referring to a materials board (a likeness of which was included in the packet).

He talked about the proposed wall between the development and the church. Minor refinements have been made to the spacing of the piers to accommodate planning staff concerns.

Mr. Silverman shared additional perspectives that provided the views from Sheely Drive across Prospect and from 730 W. Prospect, which showed The Slab's privacy fence and tree screening for The Standard.

Mr. Silverman said he believed they have addressed all of the Commission's comments in the updated design.

Public Input

None

Staff Response

Staff had no further information.

Commission Questions and Discussion

Mr. Frick stated that the project was too massive and did not relate in any way to any of the historic properties. He said the design itself is good, but far too big for the historic context.

Ms. Zink said the size complies with the zoning of the area. She commented that the stepbacks and setbacks helped, and that she liked the design. She stated she will support the project.

Ms. Gensmer agrees that it is much larger than the surrounding buildings, but the additional setbacks, stepbacks and courtyards provide the necessary articulation to mitigate the size and comply with the Land Use Code.

Ms. Wallace agrees that the project complies with 3.4.7 of the Land Use Code.

Commission Deliberation

Ms. Zink moved that the Landmark Preservation Commission recommend to the Decision Maker approval of The Standard Project Development Plan (PDP160035), finding it is in compliance with the standards contained in Land Use Code section 3.4.7 in regard to compatibility with the character of the project's area of adjacency for the reasons stated in the staff report.

Ms. Gensmer seconded.

Ms. Dunn said this project represents a battle between the zoning and the historic buildings. While the project is bigger than they would like, the Applicant has complied with zoning requirements, and has made accommodations to make the project fit with the historic context as well as it can. Given the proximity to campus, it is the perfect location for this type of project.

Acting Chair Ernest agreed with the prior comments, stating he will vote in favor of the motion. He stated that the project complies with 3.4.7.F in regards to scale and mass, design features, and building materials. He pointed out that 3.4.7.F.1 recognizes and accommodates a dissimilar height, setback and width, and stated that he believed those requirements had been met.

Motion passed 5:1, with Mr. Frick dissenting.

- **OTHER BUSINESS**

None

- **ADJOURNMENT**

Acting Chair Ernest adjourned the meeting at 7:04 p.m.

Minutes respectfully submitted by Gretchen Schiager.

Minutes approved by a vote of the Commission on

Jan 18, 2017


Doug Ernest, Acting Chair