

LANDMARK PRESERVATION COMMISSION

Regular Meeting

November 14, 1995

Council Liaison: Gina Janett

Staff Liaison: Joe Frank

SUMMARY OF MEETING: Prior to the meeting, the commission met at #11 Old Town Square, the Miller Block to investigate the site which is proposed to be the Fort Collins Police Substation and Museum. The design was discussed in depth at the meeting with representatives from Foxfire Property Management and the Fort Collins Police Department. The commission also examined the site of the proposed awning re-cover at "The Id", # 19 Old Town Square and the site of the proposed expansion of the Silver Grill, for which Mr. Frick presented a conceptual plan. At the meeting, the commission discussed the replacement of garage doors at the H. G. Maxwell House. The Schalk/Stallings House and garages, 319 E. Plum, were designated as a Local Landmark. Both the 319 East Plum residence and the M. J. Nelson House, 700 Remington, were approved for the state tax credit. The rectified Historic Old Town boundaries were presented and the CBD consultant's Scope of Work and contract were approved. The demolition of 620 South Sherwood, was also discussed.

CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL: Commission Chairman Jennifer Carpenter called the meeting to order at 5:38 p.m., 281 North College Avenue. Secretary Nicole Sneider called the roll. Commission members Jennifer Carpenter, Ruth Weatherford, Jean Kullman, Terence Hoaglund, Per Hogestad, James Tanner and Bud Frick were all present. Carol Tunner and Karen McWilliams represented staff.

GUESTS: Leanne Lawrie, Fort Collins City Planner. Dr. Steven Marks, applicant and owner of 2340 West Mulberry and Keith Gerbey from Colorado State University. Don Whitson and Pete Gazlay from the Fort Collins Police Department and Todd Lund from Foxfire Property Management. Mr. Wayne Snyder, applicant and owner of the residence at 319 East Plum. Rich Gilsdorf from Gilsdorf Canvas and Awning Inc. presented information concerning #19 Old Town Square. Mr. Jeff Bridges presented for Carie and Colleen Conway, applicants and owners of the home and carriage house at 700 Remington.

AGENDA REVIEW: A conceptual review for a remodeling of 210 Walnut for a Silver Grill expansion was added to the agenda by Mr. Frick. The proposed demolition of the house at 620 South Sherwood was added to the agenda under Other Business.

STAFF REPORT: Ms. Tunner handed out a Diversity Survey designed by Human Resources and asked for it to be completed this evening. The Human Relations Commission would like to determine the level of diversity and what ethnic backgrounds are being represented on the city's boards and commissions.

Eight Colorado State University properties will be considered for the State Register of Historic places on December 1, 1995 by the Colorado Historical Society's Historic Preservation Advisory Board.

Ms. Carpenter informed the commission she will volunteer for the review board created for the preservation of historic sites on the Colorado State University campus.

The final 1996 Work Program for the LPC was passed out to the commission.

Ms. McWilliams informed the commission that Stan Whitaker, of G.T. Land, Inc. will attend the next LPC meeting on November 28, 1995 to discuss the Harmony School shops.

COMMISSION MEMBERS' REPORTS: There were no reports.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES: Mr. Tanner moved to accept the September 26, 1995 minutes and Ms. Weatherford seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

CURRENT DESIGN REVIEW:

2340 W. Mulberry, the R.G. Maxwell House - Garage Door Replacement

Dr. Steven Marks, a veterinarian at Colorado State University, applicant and owner of the residence and Keith Gerbey from CSU joined the meeting. Pictures of the brick farmhouse, built c. 1900, were passed around. This house is a local landmark and listed on the National Register. Maxwell was an important farmer in the area. Today this home demonstrates an adaptive renovation of an attached garage set back and made of brick like the house. Dr. Marks expressed his concern over using a metal panel door on the garage. It was agreed by the commission that the garage was set far enough back that it will not unduly compromise the historic appearance of the residence. Dr. Marks remarked that he would replace the door with a new wood door if the commission could suggest one that was affordable. It was established that the current door is in too poor of shape to be repaired. The LPC recommended that he use the brown metal, or paint it terra cotta color, in order to make the structure seem less noticeable.

Ms. Weatherford moved to approve the submittal to replace the garage doors with a recommendation of using a brown door. This motion was seconded by Mr. Tanner and passed unanimously.

#11 Old Town Square, Miller Block: Conceptual Review of Awning, Neon Sign and Stairwell Renovation for Police Substation

Don Whitson and Pete Gazlay from the Fort Collins Police Department and Todd Lund from Foxfire Property Management made their presentation of the design and construction of the proposed police substation and museum in Old Town. Ms. Tunner reported to the commission what was examined and discussed on the field trip to the Miller Block prior to this evening's meeting. It was discovered that there is both an entrance outside on the north side of the building through a staircase as well as an entrance inside the building to the basement. As described in the report, an eight foot awning with a two and one half foot valence made of a PVC fabric would be lighted from underneath and have the police logo on the valence; there would also be a lighted box sign on the side of the building. The stairwell down to the basement would have to be altered to meet city code and the outside door located at the bottom of the stairwell would have to be widened and made taller. The staff's recommendations are outlined in the staff report. Mr. Whitson explained they picked a color, Pinehurst Green, which best matched the logo of the Police Department and the Polyvinyl Chloride fabric was necessary to use in order to bear the weight of the snow which will collect on the awning. He also added it would be difficult to create the layered logo on a cloth awning. Mr. Whitson noted this will be the primary entrance and it should be both inviting and safe. He explained that to replace the steps with stone would make this entrance vulnerable to snow and ice and police officers must be able to get and out quickly, while carrying their bikes. Mr. Lund added that safety is the number one issue. They would like to construct a French drain at the bottom of the stairwell to collect moisture and suggested installing stairs with a metal grip over the stone. They would like to install a handrail on either side of the steps, but the dragon tooth railing which exists at the top of the stairs will remain and can be added to with like material if necessary. Mr. Lund explained that the stairs are installed with a jigsaw fit and to remove them would disturb the design of the side walls so that metal stairs may be a good alternative. Mr. Hoaglund wanted to be assured that if the stairs were removed, then the wall would be restored, and he questioned whether the steps could be removed without disturbing the north sidewall. Ms. Carpenter suggested they keep whatever steps or stones are removed from the structure.

The commission concluded that a police substation and museum in Old Town is a wonderful idea. They explained that there is a great need to preserve the historic structure and ambiance of Old Town. The commission recognizes the applicant's special needs, but have standards to govern the historic preservation of Old Town.

Mr. Frick described the steps to be a seven inch rise and an eleven inch tread which are unevenly stacked on one another. Ms. Weatherford suggested pouring cement over the existing stone stairs in order not to tear up the north sidewall. Ms. Weatherford also pointed out the symbol on the awning, the official police logo, is very contemporary in its design and does not fit into the fabric of Historic Old Town. Mr. Tanner also pointed out that the additional box neon sign on the building can only be seen from one angle. He suggested using a smaller sign on a post which can be seen from many directions and

would fit in better with the character of Old Town. He also pointed out the awning is also functioning as a sign. Mr. Frick agreed with Mr. Tanner and said that the sign, as drawn, would project ten inches into the stairwell entrance. Mr. Whitson proposed a smaller sign and is willing to explore other ideas. Ms. Carpenter said the sign should indicate there is a museum in the substation. Mr. Whitson suggested that a temporary sandwich board indicating museum hours could be put out. Ms. Tunner commented that the Building Inspection Department doesn't allow sandwich boards on sidewalks. It is a safety issue. The commission agreed that the color of Pinehurst Green is acceptable but the shiny vinyl fabric does not meet guidelines. Mr. Frick explained the framework of the awning is the real load bearer and creates the structural integrity, not the fabric. Posts can be added to the end of the awning for extra support. He also explained that an eight foot awning and a two and one half foot valence is out of character with the design of Old Town. Ms. Carpenter agrees the awning is very contemporary and out of character for the area. It was suggested to put the logo on a slanted awning and install an old style sign of a hand pointing down to the substation and museum. Mr. Whitson stressed the police station needs to stand out and not blend in with Old Town so it can be easily identified. Ms. Weatherford requested that the signage be conspicuous but not so contemporary. Ms. Carpenter requested that the police department come up with some alternative signs. The Miller Block is an important historic building and its character must be carefully preserved.

Mr. Frick left the meeting at 6:50 P.M.

Ms. Carpenter summed up the advice of the LPC as: they don't approve of a fixed valence, the design of the entrance should preserve the historic nature of Old Town and the proportions of and fabric used for the signs should also fit in with the character of Old Town. A compromise will have to be reached concerning the alteration of the stairwell. It should be safe and inviting but little impact should be made to the stone wall and the window should be preserved. The door can be widened and moved but the original door should be saved and the new door should reflect the style which exists with a possible installation of glass panels. Mr. Hoaglund added because there is a museum in the substation the signage and design should be historically correct. Mr. Whitson thanked the LPC for taking the time to discuss their expectations and Ms. Carpenter added the conceptual design stage is a good time for discussion.

319 E. Plum, Schalk/Stallings House and Garages: Designation as a Local Landmark and State Tax Credit Review

Ms. McWilliams presented the designation of the house and garages at 319 E. Plum to the commission and showed slides. She described the house as a modest craftsman bungalow which has been virtually unaltered. The house is stucco over a wood platform frame. The two detached garages maintain the character of the residence. This property

is historically significant because of its association with Stallings, who in 1919 formed the Stallings Electric Supply Company.

Mr. Snyder asked the commission if the older dilapidated garage should be designated with the other buildings. Mr. Snyder does not want to attempt to renovate the garage at this time because the roof is caving in and the garage is in such poor repair. Ms. McWilliams suggested that it be designated. Mr. Joe Frank said it would be better to designate the garage as well because in the future Mr. Snyder can receive money from state tax credits and other incentives to preserve the structure. Ms. Carpenter said it would be better to designate the garage in order to provide the owner with options to save the structure that would not be available if it were not designated. Ms. Tunner added the garage may even be older than the house. The garage stands pushed back to the alley which indicates it may have served as a carriage house or barn.

Mr. Tanner moved to approve 319 E. Plum and garages for designation as a local landmark, seconded by Mr. Hoaglund which passed unanimously.

State Tax Credit Review:

The commission was very pleased with the way the interior rehabilitation of the house was keeping the design and character of the home. Mr. Snyder wanted to know if under the state tax credit program he could paint the fiberglass door on the garage. Mr. Hogestad explained he may have an adhesion problem with the paint but the paint on the door would be acceptable to the commission. Mr. Snyder said he may replace the door if there was a cost effective alternative. He also added that a smooth, simple, white door would be most unobtrusive to the design and character of the residence. Ms. Tunner suggested driving around town and looking for other homes and garages with a similar style to get some ideas.

Ms. Weatherford moved to approve the interior rehabilitation and the repainting or replacing of the garage door for state tax credit. Mr. Hogestad seconded this motion which passed unanimously.

The commission does not feel they have to monitor the changes to the garage door, it will be handled administratively by staff.

#19 Old Town Square. "The Id": Awning recover

The history and timeline of the building's awnings was described by Ms. Tunner from her staff report. There is no record of the left awning which exists today on the M-T Store. Rich Gilsdorf said that he pulled an awning down from that storefront because it was a safety hazard after a storm damaged the structural integrity. At the time, he assumed the client had sought approval. This evening the commission discussed whether awnings on

the same building should match. The guidelines say all elements on the same building should match but historically, awnings have been different on different storefronts on the same building. Ms. Tunner explained the commission needs to be careful not to set a precedent allowing different awnings on the same building. It was decided the guidelines don't require matching awnings. Ms. Weatherford explained the commission is looking for compatibility in Historic Old Town but also variety. Mr. Lund from Foxfire Property Management added that different stores are unique and varied awnings help to break up the storefronts, as long as the colors are compatible.

Mr. Hoaglund moved to approve #19 Old Town Square as submitted, seconded by Ms. Weatherford. The motion passed unanimously.

700 Remington, M. J. Nelson House: State Tax Credit Review

Jeff Bridges introduced Carie and Colleen Conway to the commission, described their residence and Bed & Breakfast property and presented slides. The residence has not been locally designated but is located in the Laurel School National Register Historic District. Some renovation work was done on the house in 1994 and 1995. Now the owners are committed to preserving the home and carriage house for historic landmark designation and want to seek approval for future projects from the LPC. They seek review and input on restoring some characteristics and historic design elements. They would like state tax credit for work on the interior, fundamental equipment and foundation. The carriage house will not be considered for state tax credit at this time. Mr. Bridges showed a 1952 photo of the house in which the upper baluster, aluminum siding and shutters were not present. It also shows the trim modified and the brick porch existed at that time. On the south side of the house there is an original oriole window. Ms. Tunner did not think the shutters or brick porch appeared to be original. Mr. Bridges showed slides of trees growing in the foundation. He explained the addition on the house is historic because it was built with stone from Horsetooth prior to the reservoir. Mr. Bridges thought the addition had been built soon after the main house. The original light fixtures are still in the house but have been moved to different rooms. It was recommended by engineers to install ceiling fans in the bedrooms upstairs with period type light fixtures.

Mr. Tanner moved to approve the State Tax Credit Review proposal as submitted with the provision lighting choices be subjected to administrative review. This motion was seconded by Ms. Weatherford and passed unanimously.

Discussion of the Carriage House at 700 Remington: Conceptual Changes to the Entrance Door

Mr. Bridges explained that the carriage house was built in 1905. There is evidence of a sliding door and symmetrical windows exist across the end of the carriage house. The

striated brick on the porch of the house matches the brick used in the chimney and the upstairs is finished with plaster. The history indicates there were two houses built next to each other by the same family and they may have shared use of the carriage house. It is thought the carriage house may have been used as servants' or auxiliary quarters because there is elaborate molding and wood floors in the upstairs room. It was estimated that it would cost approximately \$40,000 to do the structural upgrades and foundation work just to restore the carriage house as a storage area. It was assessed that the key of the plaster has been penetrated with water and there is too much damage to preserve any of it. The wood floors also have too much water damage to be restored but they will try to preserve the wood molding. The owner would like to convert the carriage house into a service use. There will need to be additional windows installed to add more natural light. A cross gable roof would be a more traditional approach to adding more light on the west elevation. Two end gable windows already exist. They would also like to add a flat roof protection feature with a porch and balusters over the entrance which would match the front facade of the house. Ms. Carpenter noted this design is more elaborate than would have existed for a service building. Mr. Tanner suggested keeping the structure recognizable as a carriage house but still satisfying the need for light and a protected entrance way. Ms. Carpenter suggested using solar tubes which act as a light well instead of adding two new roof windows. Ms. Weatherford thought the south elevation sliding door can be preserved by filling the inside frame with glass, which would help to provide light inside the building. Ms. Carpenter noted this is a simple building and therefore you should look for simple solutions. Ms. Weatherford and Mr. Bridges also discussed the old furnace inside the main house. Ms. Weatherford suggested walling off the area around the furnace with concrete blocks because asbestos mitigation and removal is so expensive. Mr. Bridges suggested saving the front plates from the furnace which read "L. J. Muller Boiler" and put them somewhere else in the house. The LPC will see more of the interior of the house when it is proposed for local landmark designation and a local rehabilitation grant.

210 Walnut Street - Silver Grill Expansion: Conceptual Design Review

Ms. Tunner presented the commission with conceptual design plans of changes to the facade of the building next to the Silver Grill, where the owner will be expanding his restaurant. Mr. Frick had suggested painting the brick ("Miami Stone") because there is nothing significant about it and to cut the existing window downwards to the same lower dimension of the windows on the Silver Grill. The Commission was in agreement on the concept and encouraged the proper materials be submitted for the next LPC meeting.

DISCUSSION ITEMS:

Historic Old Town Boundaries

Ms. McWilliams explained only building lots were included in the legal description of the

original HOT designation. It is now proposed to include all streets, alleys and everything else to the curb-line of the sidewalk.

RFP Process for CBD Survey

The RFP committee selected Retrospect, Inc. as the most qualified consulting firm to do the Central Business District Survey. They negotiated changes to the scope of work and discussed a payment schedule. Ms. McWilliams approved the contract. The LPC accepted the consultant.

Ms. Weatherford moved to accept the Central Business District scope of work and contract, seconded by Mr. Hogestad, which passed unanimously.

The LPC discussed whether it is necessary to review the scope of work and contract. The commission requested the staff to put together a policy for dealing with consultants and present it to the LPC. Ms. Weatherford stressed the procedure should be created to monitor the ongoing work of a consultant. They questioned how much involvement the LPC should have in this process.

OTHER BUSINESS:

Demolition of 620 South Sherwood

Ms. McWilliams explained that Mr. Mark Cucarola from Littleton, Colorado has requested a demolition permit to demolish the residence at 620 South Sherwood and to build a four-plex, flat roof building. The house was built in 1895. A 1925 Sanborn Map showed the current bay window as a door. It is the third structure from the university and the two next to it have already been replaced apartment complexes. Ms. Carpenter, in discussion with Ms. McWilliams, put the Demolition Delay ordinance into affect. This is the first time this has been done. Ms. Weatherford recommended a non-consensual designation as one idea. Ms. Tunner questioned if the home could be relocated.

Mr. Cucarola needs to get an administrative site plan approval. This case is a "use by right. An historic resource and inventory form and a report on how demolishing the home will impact the neighborhood were submitted by the applicant. The size of the area to be surveyed to determine the impact of demolition/relocation is related to the size of the project.

Ms. Kullman suggested that the LPC chairperson consult with City Council about this demolition.

Tuesday Night Meetings

Ms. Tunner said Mr. Frank asked her to find another meeting room and to move the meetings to Wednesday night. Ms. Carpenter is available the first Wednesday of the month but not the third Wednesday. It was decided to continue to meet on Tuesday.

Mr. Hoaglund moved to adjourn the meeting, was seconded by Ms. Weatherford and passed unanimously.

The meeting adjourned at 8:50 P.M.

The minutes were submitted by Nicole Sneider, secretary.