

MINUTES

CITY OF FORT COLLINS • BOARDS AND COMMISSIONS



AIR QUALITY ADVISORY BOARD

TYPE OF MEETING – REGULAR

November 19, 2018, 5:30 – 8:00 pm
Colorado River Room, 222 Laporte Ave.

1. CALL TO ORDER

5:33 pm

2. ROLL CALL

- List of Board Members Present
 - Karen Artell
 - Greg Clark
 - Jim Dennison
 - Harry Edwards
 - Arsineh Hecobian, Chair
 - Mark Houdashelt
 - Matt Tribby
 - Chris Wood
 - Vara Vissa, Vice-Chair

- List of Board Members Absent – Excused or Unexcused; if no contact with Chair has been made
 - N/A

- List of Staff Members Present
 - Cassie Archuleta, Staff Liaison
 - Honore Depew, Sr. Sustainability Specialist

- List of Guests
 - N/A

3. AGENDA REVIEW

- No changes

4. CITIZEN PARTICIPATION

- N/A

5. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

- Harry moved, and Chris seconded a motion to approve the October 15, 2018

MINUTES

CITY OF FORT COLLINS • BOARDS AND COMMISSIONS



AIR QUALITY ADVISORY BOARD

TYPE OF MEETING – REGULAR

minutes *as revised*. Motion passed, 9-0-0.

- The Board discussed the wording in the 100% Renewable Energy presentation given at the September 17, 2018 AQAB meeting.

Staff Follow-Up: Cassie will pass along the Board's request that future presentations regarding Platte River's Renewable Energy portfolio be clear about what types of renewable sources are represented.

6. UNFINISHED BUSINESS

Update on the BFO process

- The City is amidst a two-year budget process. City Council will vote on next year's budget tomorrow night at a meeting open to the Public. The Environmental Services program budget will be reduced, zero-interest loans for wood stove conversions, mold and radon mitigation systems will no longer be offered, and staff will be rearranged; however, air quality programs fared well despite the cuts.
 - Jim asked how environmental programs fared as a percentage of the overall City budget and Greg enquired if the dollar amount for the environmental programs budget remained the same.
 - Cassie responded that overall funding declined as a percentage of the City budget and that actual dollar amounts budgeted decreased for most departments and service areas.
 - Karen enquired about the Keep Fort Collins Great tax.
 - Cassie responded that funding is in place through 2020, but that will be a separate discussion for the AQAB as it will have air quality implications and will come up for a citizen vote.
 - Arsineh asked if there is anything left for the Board to do with regards to BFOs.
 - Cassie responded that there will be an opportunity for public comment during the Council meeting. Also, there will be an opportunity for mid-term budget revisions, at the request of Council. The Board can make recommendations to Council to consider revisions (likely to begin around April of next year).
 - Arsineh suggested adding this to the Board's agenda in 2019.

7. NEW BUSINESS

a. Regional Wasteshed Planning

Honore Depew, Sr. Sustainability Specialist, reviewed a proposed Larimer County Solid

AIR QUALITY ADVISORY BOARD

TYPE OF MEETING – REGULAR

Waste Infrastructure Master Plan (SWIMP) and outlined a draft Intergovernmental Agreement (IGA), for infrastructure and policy commitments between Larimer County and Fort Collins. Staff will be seeking direction from City Council on December 11th to move forward with formal consideration of these measures for increasing diversion of construction debris and organic material. A letter of support from AQAB to Council is requested.

- No further expansions at the current landfill are possible. It is now expected to reach capacity and close by 2024; the date has been moved up by six months due to an influx of construction debris resulting from recent hail damage.
- Larimer County Capital Investments in the wasteshed will include:
 - New landfill (\$11.7 million)
 - Central transfer station (\$15.8 million)
 - Recycling center upgrades (\$3 million)
 - Yard and food waste composting facilities (\$11.8 million)
 - Construction and demolition debris processing facility (\$13.7 million)
 - No tax revenue will be utilized and Fort Collins will not be asked to contribute capital to these investments
- The proposed facilities could all be co-located near the current facility between Fort Collins and Loveland, including a transfer station, which would be a modern enclosed building.
- The proposed new landfill would be located in the northern part of Larimer County. Around 30 – 60 trucks per day would travel from the transfer station to a new landfill.
- Other facilities would include open windrows for yard waste, partially-enclosed aerated static piles for food waste composting, a construction and demolition debris sorting facility and recycling center upgrades.
- An intergovernmental agreement (IGA) will be reviewed by Council in Q1 of next year.
 - The County would commit to finance, construct, own and manage the proposed facilities and maintain a hauler licensing program. (All infrastructure is outlined in the master plan.)
 - Municipalities would commit to establish supportive policies for waste handling, including rules to help drive material to new facilities, and participate in a County advisory board.
 - Recommended policies include flow control of construction and demolition debris (mixed loads, 10-year term) and mixed recyclables (single-stream recycling,

AIR QUALITY ADVISORY BOARD

TYPE OF MEETING – REGULAR

residential and commercial) to ensure that they go to the new facilities.

- Economic benefits include public-private partnership opportunities, transfer and hauling opportunities, and jobsite convenience for the building community.
- Loveland modeled costs associated with this plan for their residents and even if there were a higher increase to tipping fees of 50%, there would only be a collection fee increase of 6%.

Discussion

- Mark asked if the privately-owned Weld County landfill was still being considered as an option for waste disposal.
 - Honore responded that it was considered but was not ultimately recommended based on several factors including the desire to have public control over the facility (public landfill).
- Vara asked why the recycling rate were low, and what the change in recycling rates might be with new facilities.
- Vara asked if residents along the proposed truck routes have been warned of traffic increases.
 - Honore responded that, as it's very early, no statements have been issued regarding changes in traffic.
- Mark enquired if the daily truck estimate is based on the current trash volume?
 - Honore responded affirmatively and stated that the City hopes the trash flow will dwindle further as the resource recovery facilities come online.
- Matt asked if any calculations have been made to determine the additional emissions generated from transporting garbage to a new northern landfill.
 - Honore replied that 11 different scenarios were examined by a third-party consultant and dollar values associated with air quality impacts were assigned to each. Each scenario was modeled to determine the benefit cost ratio (TBL impacts were included in the model). Furthermore, staff has done extensive research on the composting options and concluded that emissions associated with landfilling organic waste are higher than transporting it.
- Mark asked if electric trucks were modeled for waste transportation.
 - Honore responded that they were not, but he hopes to bring this option into the conversation in the few years before the new system is operational.
- Vara asked if there will be any intermediate collection points to reduce the number of trips?

AIR QUALITY ADVISORY BOARD

TYPE OF MEETING – REGULAR

- Honore replied that there will not be any others in Fort Collins, but there are and will continue to be collection points in Estes Park, Wellington and Red Feather Lakes.
- Vara asked if there will be pre-sorting at the new landfill.
 - Honore stated that the indoor transfer station would allow staff to see what people are dumping and reroute them, if necessary, as a form of pre-sorting.
- Jim asked how staff would know if someone dumped something that they shouldn't.
 - Honore responded that people typically tell staff what they're dumping.
- Jim asked if residents would still be welcome to dispose of trash.
 - Honore replied affirmatively, noting that the Coalition is hoping to increase convenience to the landfill for citizens. It will continue to host household hazardous waste drop off, educational opportunities, etc.
- Jim stated that he's never seen anyone at the current landfill providing education to people that are throwing away cardboard, etc. He asked why staff are not currently performing this task to aid in diversion of recyclable materials.

Staff Follow-Up: Honore will reach out to the County to initiate more on-site education to divert recyclable materials.

- Vara believes that education will be key and that incentives should be given to prompt people to recycle or compost more.
- Harry enquired if converting waste to energy has been considered.
 - Honore replied that waste-to-energy options were examined by the City initially but didn't make the cut as a result of their benefit-cost ratios. Upfront costs for such options are approximately \$100-300 million. Waste-to-energy options have been put into a second tier of options.
- Greg asked if new technologies will be considered throughout the lifespan of the next 30-year planning process.
 - Honore replied that the plan is written to include an Advisory Council that will evaluate new technologies and opportunities as they emerge.
- Matt asked if the County is confident that the 2024 date won't be pushed forward again and asked if there is a contingency plan if this does happen.
 - Honore stated that there is no guaranty that the time frame won't be pushed forward again. The new transfer station will be constructed first so that this service will be available even if the current landfill fills ahead of "schedule". In addition,

AIR QUALITY ADVISORY BOARD

TYPE OF MEETING – REGULAR

waste can be transferred to private facilities along the Front Range if necessary.

- Matt asked if this would increase vehicle traffic or increase prices for citizens.

Staff Follow-Up: Honore will provide more details regarding contingency planning.

- Mark stated that approximately 50% of Fort Collins' waste goes to a privately-owned landfill near Ault and asked what the incentive will be to utilize the new facility.
 - Honore confirmed that between 40 – 60% of Fort Collins' waste goes to private landfills based on financial and geographic factors, as determined by trash haulers. He went on to note that the disposal fees determined by Larimer County affect prices in the region.
- Mark asked if flow control could be applied to organics.
 - Honore responded that while it could be, it has not been proposed at this time, as it is less cost-effective. A suite of other incentives and policies will be developed to encourage organics diversion.
- Chris and Honore discussed recent media attention regarding markets for recycled material and how it makes its way into landfills. While recycling is better than adding waste to landfills, abstaining from purchasing products with disposable packaging, etc., is most preferable. The recycling system has been disrupted as a result of China no longer accepting certain plastics. Domestic markets need to begin filling the gaps. If curbside recyclables are directed to a single facility, it may set the stage for better contracts and future investment based on assured volumes.
- Jim asked what compliance rates are for participating in construction waste recycling.
 - Honore noted that participation has been mixed until about last year, when the City hired a full-time employee to investigate compliance on construction sites and review waste plans, which resulted in over 85% compliance.
- Jim and Honore discussed how Fort Collins ranks against neighboring communities with regards to recycling. A statewide report released this week showed Fort Collins' overall recycling rate in 2017 was 55% (including industrial diversion); however, the City ranked lower for residential diversion. There's still a lot of room for improvement.
- Vara asked if Loveland will continue organic waste recycling under this new plan.
 - Honore responded affirmatively.
- *Arsineh summarized the Boards discussion by mentioning key points including:*
 - *Concerns about emissions from increased vehicular exhaust*
 - *Consideration for use of electric trucks/vehicles*
 - *Reduction of waste through education planning and corporate responsibility*

AIR QUALITY ADVISORY BOARD

TYPE OF MEETING – REGULAR

- *A need for continual improvement in technologies and energy transformation*
- *A need for a cogent contingency plan*
- Honore asked for a letter of support for the plan and the IGA (including the flow control policies) from the Board before February 12, 2019. The alternative to this plan is that the County will build a transfer station and build a new landfill without Fort Collins, and business will continue as usual. By adopting the IGA, Fort Collins will not be committing funding, it will be committing to adopt policies which will support these County investments. Larimer County needs Fort Collins and Loveland on board for this to work.
- Mark, Greg and Honore discussed the side-effects of approving of the IGA. To some extent, it will limit free market options for haulers, but there won't be a significant increase in compliance code implementation and burden to City resources or Staff time. Honore noted that this plan provides a foundation for a cost-effective organics program, which would significantly cut greenhouse gas emissions.
- Mark asked if it would be possible to push up the timeline at all.
 - Honore responded affirmatively but said that it depends on the level of confidence in policy development to support each element of the plan. The IGA will have trigger mechanisms to coordinate the interaction between waste supply and construction of new facilities.
- Mark motioned, and Karen seconded a vote to submit a letter of support for the Wasteshed Plan and IGA. Motion passed 8-1-0
 - Arsineh will distribute the Board's recommendation as a Google document so that members can add comments prior to submitting it to Council. The deadline for comments is November 28, 2018.
 - Vara is adamantly against the plan and signing the IGA. She would like the City to work on its own plan that addresses the "heart of the problem."

b. Air Quality Update

Cassie Archuleta, Air Quality Program Manager, provided an informational update regarding air quality data measurement and the State Implementation Planning process for ozone. She distributed new outreach materials to the Board and asked for feedback.

Outreach

- There is a new City website to track criteria pollutant levels including CO, O₃, PM₁₀, PM_{2.5} and visibility.
- The City has installed a new ozone bench at The Gardens on Spring Creek, which

AIR QUALITY ADVISORY BOARD

TYPE OF MEETING – REGULAR

measures ozone and particulate matter and reports values to the City's website for the public. Ozone-sensitive flora will be planted around the bench to provide visual indications on high ozone days. Cassie presented potential sign mock-ups for the exhibit and asked for Board input on the outreach materials presented. An open house will kick off the start of monitoring at the Gardens.

Ozone Update

- Ozone is still the most severe air quality issue faced by Fort Collins; monitors within the City consistently measure high concentrations.
- Ozone is not emitted directly from sources but results from photochemical reactions of chemicals that occur from fossil fuel combustion processes (NO_x), biogenic/petroleum-based emissions (VOCs), etc.
- The City has an ozone monitor west of town and one downtown, and it's likely that both will be in non-attainment for the 2015 NAAQS. State Implementation Plans are developed by the Regional Air Quality Council (RAQC).

Particulate Matter (PM) Update

- PM is a criteria pollutant that consists of a mixture of solid particles and liquid droplets small enough to be inhaled. PM₁₀ and PM_{2.5} are regulated by the EPA and are generally made of complex chemical mixtures (mineral oxides, sulfates, nitrates, organic material, etc.).
- Monitoring data shows fairly steady concentrations of PM₁₀ in Fort Collins, and while we are not in exceedance, we've come close during years with numerous wildfires. PM_{2.5} has exceeded the 24-hour standard during some recent years. To help remedy this, the City is focusing on decreasing vehicle use, fugitive dust and wood smoke.

Discussion

- Greg asked what enforcement will be implemented for the SIP and who will implement it.
 - Cassie replied that enforcement will be part of the state permitting process. Once it's in the SIP, it is considered a federal mandate and enforced through state regulations. If the state does not perform satisfactory enforcement, the federal government (EPA) will intervene. If Colorado does not produce a SIP, the EPA can implement one. The RAQC takes the lead on SIP development. The AQAB can provide comments during the SIP development process.
 - Matt noted that when the State does a SIP call, they'll engage individual cities, but it's likely that they will target stationary sites first as it is easier to regulate emissions from large stationary emitters than to analyze emissions on a community level.

MINUTES

CITY OF FORT COLLINS • BOARDS AND COMMISSIONS



AIR QUALITY ADVISORY BOARD

TYPE OF MEETING – REGULAR

- Jim asked if the State is considering all viable options, for example, shutting down oil and gas production on high ozone days.
 - Matt responded that this would be a very involved process. In the past, Colorado Regulation 7 has had to be revised in response to ozone issues. The State has had to walk a fine line between showing progress and shutting down businesses.
- Vara stated that she would like to see more grassroots efforts and action/involvement beyond just SIP development, as she does not believe that Fort Collins should only rely on the SIP to drive policy.

Staff Follow-Up: Cassie will send link to RAQC agenda so that the Board can stay up to date on this issue.

8. BOARD MEMBER REPORTS

- Due to time limitations, Board member reports were not discussed.

9. OTHER BUSINESS

- Due to time limitations, no other business was discussed.

10. ADJOURNMENT

8:07 pm