

**MINUTES
CITY OF FORT COLLINS
AIR QUALITY ADVISORY BOARD**

Date: Monday, September 21, 2015
Location: Community Room, 215 N. Mason Street
Time: 5:30–8:00pm

For Reference

John Shenot, Chair
Ross Cunniff, Council Liaison 970-420-7398
Lucinda Smith, Interim Staff Liaison 970-224-6085

Board Members Present

Robert Kirkpatrick
Rich Fisher
Gregory Miller
Tom Griggs
Mark Houdashelt
Vara Vissa (arrived 6:35)

Board Members Absent

John Shenot, Chair
Jim Dennison

Staff Present

Lucinda Smith, Environmental Services Director
Dianne Tjalkens, Admin/Board Support
Caroline Mitchell, Environmental Planner
Lindsay Ex, Environmental Program Manager

Staff Absent

Councilmembers Present

Guests

Call to order: 5:35pm

Public Comments: None

Staff Updates: None

Review and Approval of Minutes:

Tom moved and Rich seconded a motion to approve the August 2015 AQAB minutes as amended.
Motion passed unanimously, 5-0-0. Vara arrived after vote.
Corrections: Get name of guest from previous minutes or John.

AGENDA ITEM 1: Community Recycling Ordinance

Caroline Mitchell, Environmental Planner, presented information about the process to update the Community Recycling Ordinance, status of the project, and options under consideration.

Pay-As-You-Throw ordinance began in 1995, which was innovative at the time and has become a best practice to drive recycling. It has been updated several times since. This project will update and expand the ordinance. In 1999 set a 50% diversion rate; met and surpassed this goal. Have since implemented electronic waste and cardboard landfill bans. New goal includes 75% diversion by 2020. At 65% now. Longer term goal of zero waste. Road to Zero Waste was adopted in 2013. Bans are enforced primarily through education.

Haulers can refuse loads that clearly have cardboard or electronics. Complaints are followed up on by staff. Role of City is education and policy, as hauling is done by private companies. WRAP is program targeted to multifamily and business community that includes incentives and rebates, and Pay-As-You-Throw ordinance has only applied to single family residential to date. With Pay-As-You-Throw recycling is bundled with trash service and pricing is based on volume of trash can subscribed to, with a 100% price increment between sizes. Multifamily and commercial currently have separate recycling service. 95% of single family homes, 68% of multifamily, and 48% of commercial have recycling service. Staff is working with consulting company that has compiled case studies, has done significant public outreach, is creating recommendations, and will go to Work Session October 13. Draft options include short-, mid-, and long-term changes. Discussing reducing rate incline to 80% (offsetting increase in rates due to adding services), adding yard waste service for single family, bundling recycling with trash for multifamily and commercial, phasing in organics collection, eventually expanding bans to include all curbside recyclables and organics, etc. Organics in landfill generate methane, so composting is beneficial to air quality and GHG reduction. Another idea is to reduce collection of trash to once every two weeks since organics would be collected once a week. As divert additional waste, can reduce trash service, which also offsets price changes. There are significant GHG reductions associated with recyclables and organics diversion.

Comments/Q&A

- Is City considering dividing city into districts for haulers?
 - Not as part of this project and not in near future. Last brought up in 2010.
- What is distinction between single family and multifamily?
 - If each unit has its own cart, they are considered single family homes. If the location has a dumpster that multiple units share, it is considered multifamily. Different types/sizes of trucks that service different types of containers. Multifamily and commercial tend to have big metal dumpsters so they are categorized together.
- If multifamily or commercial don't have recycling, and still have to recycle cardboard, do they have to self-haul?
 - Yes. The cardboard ordinance increased recycling rates of multifamily and commercial and drop offs at the recycling center. However, many may still be putting in trash.
 - Commercial is biggest user of cardboard.
- Explain rate incline changes.
 - Ex: If add organics and keep 100% incline, prices go up significantly. If have a lower incline, such as 80%, keep largest can size price from being prohibitive. Also, data shows 80% incline maintains optimal diversion.
- Would composting be done by the City?
 - City does not have a facility. However, A1 Organics has yard waste recycling that was recently permitted to add food scraps. Also, largest biodigester was just completed outside of Greeley. Processes liquid waste from Laprino cheese factory and feed lots. Will also accept all food waste. Microbes generate methane, which is captured and used as natural gas. Waste is turned into compost. Would make sense to create a transfer station to get organics to a large scale facility. If create ordinance about organics the private sector will likely provide the facilities.
- How are haulers reacting to proposed changes?
 - Staff has been in constant communication with haulers. Parts that all support. Mixing together options that meet all needs. All options are feasible for haulers, but would have a phase-in period. This allows them to work with customers, purchase and distribute new bins, change routes, etc. Also considered requiring recycling, but with no set service level. Found in research that commercial tends to low-ball how much recycling they needed when determining own service.
- Fort Collins will make a bigger dent in GHG reduction with source reduction of packaging.
 - Pay-As-You-Throw system somewhat drives source reduction. Ex: Paying to throw away grass clippings, or leave them on the ground? Consumer will likely choose to leave them. Extended producer responsibility is a way to reduce packaging. This ordinance will not address this, but it is being worked on elsewhere.

- The GHG figures are annual or projected total over time?
 - Annual. 2014 baseline.
 - What is percentage of overall GHG emissions?
 - If achieved, fairly high percent of estimated reductions. About a quarter to a third of 2020 reduction goal.
- Credit counting: Some do backyard composting. Can that be estimated?
 - City supports backyard composting. Two benefits from full scale composting: 1. Even with excellent education program can only get about 5% of single family to compost at home. 2. Commercial scale can take more materials than can put in backyard, including meat, oils, food-soiled paper products, etc.
- What is City doing in waste reduction?
 - Very difficult. Communities that adopt Pay-As-You-Throw have 6% reduction in trash. When have to pay per unit of trash, people start to make different choices. Only quantifiable thing in our current programing.
 - Have had educational programs including ways to get off junk mail lists.
 - Plastic bag ordinance would have been source reduction project as well.
 - 2014 community GHG inventory, solid waste was 70K tons.
- Landfill collects methane and flares it?
 - Two landfills: Larimer County and Ault. Larimer County has methane capture that is flared. Ault has no methane capture system. City requests destination of materials from haulers. Broader debate on how much methane actually gets captured in the process.
 - Lucinda will get more data about what is flared at landfill and algorithm that calculates net emissions and provide to board.
- Is City considering composting versus biodigesters?
 - Separated food waste would go to biodigester and yard waste mixed with food waste would go to composting.
- Gap in organics collection for multifamily. Also, does collection create a reverse incentive for grocery stores to divert food to biodigester that would otherwise go to Food Bank?
 - Will figure out organics collection process in other sectors, then move toward adding multifamily. Single family is fairly uniform as are food scraps from large generators. Groceries would have to pay to have organics collected. Hierarchy is to prevent food waste, feed people, feed animals, then compost.
 - EPA is pushing to reduce food waste. Has food recovery challenge.
 - USDA also.
 - Multifamily could have pilot projects down the line?
 - Yes. Certainly.
- Will City have cooperative agreement with biodigester for biogas?
 - Doubt that. Biodigester financed by Sacramento Municipal Utility District which receives all the credits for the natural gas.
- Alliance of some sort that could be established between cities, or in the state, aimed at directing food to Food Banks, schools, etc. Worked with Grant Family Farms. A lot of waste in the field. When go to grocery store pick the very best. In field only pick top produce, then wholesaler, then retailer, so a lot of waste in the chain. Had gleaning from churches that take to the Food Bank.
- What does Caroline need from board?
 - Recommendation could come between Work Session and adoption.
 - Could happen at either time, depending on how strongly the board wants to give input before Work Session. Summary of feedback will be part of Work Session materials.
- Changes in recycling market?
 - Huge shift in business model with dip in recycling prices globally. Haulers are paying to drop off recyclables now, whereas last year they were being paid for recyclables. Talking about modification to existing business structure. Haulers are trying to plan for next year, including rates.
 - Organics would become revenue stream for haulers?

- Expertise is in hauling materials. Need to cover costs and profit percentage from any services they provide. Details include timing of infrastructure investment, staffing, trucks, containers, etc.

Rob moved and Greg seconded the following motion: The Air Quality Advisory Board recommends adoption of the Community Recycling Ordinance with current proposed options and is encouraged by the significant Greenhouse Gas reductions that would be actualized with its implementation. The board supports inclusion of pilot projects for recycling of organic materials from multifamily. The board encourages approval of the ordinance as soon as possible, as it will aid the City in reaching its stated Climate Action Plan goals and organics recovery for food production.

Motion passed unanimously, 6-0-0.

- Multifamily sometimes has large commercial kitchens. Ex: senior housing.
 - Cafeterias involved with multifamily could be included with large food waste producers.
 - Don't have multifamily organics currently listed because it is trickier. Multifamily we are discussing are ones that do not have commercial kitchens. Important, but working out system with other locations first.
 - Centralized kitchens can be part of pilot programs.
 - Doubt there are many multifamily that have unified kitchens.
 - Fort Collins has many retirement facilities.
 - May technically fall into category of business. Can make sure definition includes these.
- Besides GHG, also about restoring soil. Organics recovery to produce food. Multiple benefits.
- Where can compost be used?
 - Permitting is very strict. If compostable materials are created and used in one place, the regulations are not as strict.

ACTION ITEM: Lucinda will get more data about how much methane is flared at landfill and algorithm that calculates net emissions and provide to board.

AGENDA ITEM 2: CAP Implementation Update

Lindsay Ex, Environmental Program Manager, and Lucinda Smith, ESD Director, provided an update on the status of efforts to implement the Climate Action Plan.

Lindsay Ex has worked for the City in Planning for five years, was lead on Nature in the City project, and has accepted the position vacated by Melissa Hovey—Climate Action Plan program manager and in charge of air quality programming.

Have 2014 report on change in emissions since 2005, including municipal and community. Since 2011 emissions are rising, but population and economy have grown more. Municipal GHG emissions have had reductions in last year, including significant alternative fuel vehicles, leading to reduction in fleet emissions. Municipal is all government services: transit, water treatment, government buildings, etc., and is approximately 2% of total community emissions. Surplus power generated and sold by Platte River is not included in community emissions, but we are starting to look at “ownership share”. The CAP Framework document is high level strategic plan that identifies pathways toward reduction goals. Each action will require further development and analysis. Current innovative actions include community solar garden, on-bill financing, Lose-A-Watt, Low Stress Bike network, Community Recycling Ordinance, Car Share Planning, advanced metering data tools, peak partners demand-response, etc. Leadership includes Council, Executive Team, Core Teams, Strategic Initiative Teams, Community Advisory Committee, and Community. Have formed 10 teams of City staff and will be adding community experts, including teams for climate resilience and water and land use. Project teams are developing work plans. Support teams are focused on making work plans feasible, such as marketing, financing, etc. Work Plans are brainstorms from staff at this time; will be vetted by staff and community. Example: Measuring CAP Performance (support team) will identify

performance indicators for actions. Will have CAP dashboard to track progress. Preliminary Work Plans will feed into the 2020 CAP Strategic Plan. Ultimate goal is business plan for each action item to include lead implementer, partners, costs, timeframe, milestones, metrics, impacts, and co-benefits. Community Engagement includes website, branding, quarterly updates to Council, community forums, Community Advisory Committee, visits to boards and commissions, etc.

Midcycle BFO offers that have been advanced include water reclamation biogas to co-gen, energy efficiency building code performance (hire contractor to evaluate performance of new buildings to make sure comply with code), business planning for strategic initiatives and public-private partnerships (researching financing models), and CAP communication, engagement and progress tracking. Performance measurement team will develop metrics. Partnership with Platte River is imperative to reaching goals. Their staff has been researching scenarios to lower emissions, including potential of backing away from coal. Potential resource changes include significantly increasing wind and solar by 2035. Next steps include work plan development, refined model available in December, forming community advisory committee over the winter, and completing 2020 strategic plan by Q2 2016.

Comments/Q&A

- Community solar garden was fully subscribed quickly. Is the City planning another?
 - Funding was not in last BFO process. However, teams have formed to investigate for next budget cycle.
- Does nothing get started until 2020?
 - Framework is looking at how to reach 2050 goals. The 2020 strategic plan will lead how we reach 2020 goals. Work is starting now. Developing BFO offers.
 - A lot of theory, when does it go into practice?
 - Many things that support GHG reduction and other goals as well are budgeted and/or already in place. As develop 2020 strategic plan (possible draft before Council March 2016), will capture net effect of existing actions. As continue to measure community GHG inventory over time, actions will be reflected in metrics.
 - Energy Policy, if adopted as proposed, is important document for leading reductions in GHG emissions. Carbon goals progress is being measured. Incremental journey, but perhaps could have a CAP kickoff date to solidify.
- What determines implementation timeframe in strategic plan? Prioritization/urgency versus long term projects? Did modelling assume everything started in 2016? If can't start as modelled, what does that do to costs and when you achieve goals?
 - CAP framework model had most strategies starting in 2015, but ramping up incrementally based on some assumptions. If not on track, will need to reevaluate. Team working on updating assumptions, measuring progress.
 - Did modelling look at 2030 goal, or 2020 first?
 - Assumption as part of "adjusted business as usual" was Platte River meeting their stated guidelines. They have not committed to that. The CAP model and analysis got to 32% below by 2020, but with imbedded assumption about Platte River. Update will provide more information on what Platte River will actually do.
 - Would coal units at Craig be replaced by other sources?
 - Craig largely supplies surplus sales. May not find another avenue for surplus sales, also looking at reducing use and diversifying portfolio.
- Upward trend on community emissions. Any numbers for 2015?
 - Only do inventory once a year. Utilities periodically tracks electric usage. Also track certain aspects of natural gas usage (report quarterly with Lose-A-Watt). Will not do full inventory more often than annually. Solid waste data is time consuming. Might be able to get other indicators quarterly.
 - Should be able to get municipal emissions more frequently.
 - Potential to report some elements quarterly.
 - Trend is in wrong direction right now. Important to see numbers frequently for education.
- New car standard and clean power plan. Part of baseline or reductions of CAP?

- Reductions that are quantified are those beyond the adjusted business as usual baseline, which included big chunk from Platte River. Take out benefit of CAFE standards and Platte River, and everything else is addressed in CAP. Clean Power Plan uses 2012 as baseline.
- What is “purchased” in Platte River diagrams?
 - Platte River generates some surplus power and buys power from other sources.
 - Could have come from coal or hydro, or other?
 - It can come from various sources, but they know where it comes from.
 - Accounting for all sources of purchased power (variable).
- Indianapolis is starting 100% electric vehicle car sharing with 100 cars. Will move up to 500 cars. Is this an option the City is looking at?
 - Paul Sizemore could give more updates. City is working with CSU to do small scale electric car share program at CSU. Unsure of status of that project. Also looking at Zip car, which would be first time implemented in medium sized community. Can look more into that program.
 - Two car share vehicles on CSU campus.
 - Program would be larger and expanded to community.
 - Uber or Lyft? Business doing this?
 - Not aware of initiatives to start Uber in Fort Collins.
 - There are average four parking lots per person. Showing that don’t need to own a car, reduce parking lots locking up land, etc. Happening in a big way in other communities.
 - Have many discussions about reducing parking capacity, but a lot of pushback from community. Dense, walkable cities, but concerns about parking.
 - Increase penetration, social acceptance, cultural shift.
 - Parking minimums in City Plan. City is having overall conversation about parking. People who show up to meetings are those who are worried about issues of less parking.
 - Next generation will not need a car.

AGENDA ITEM 3: Updates and Announcements

Dust Prevention and Control

- In Dust meeting, went over manual. Consensus was strategies have significant reduction of dust, but want more information on cost. Two more meetings before will be considered by Council. Can act as late as November meeting to have recommendations for December adoption.

Transportation Air Quality Impacts Guidance Manual

- Project has been delayed, but can add to October agenda. Discuss elements to include in RFP. Want contract by end of the year. Melissa set up meeting with consultant that works on transportation projects. Got input on scope. Raised questions on whether can use it to analyze City projects for climate action as well. Staff will discuss before next meeting and bring materials to board.
 - Origin of discussion had to do with Lincoln and Harmony corridors. Presentations from City staff showed no consideration of air quality in design of projects. Recognition that there are tools to analyze impacts. If model entire city, can make changes based on design concepts.
 - Was not aware of idea of transportation modelling for city. Transportation Master Plan revision may be funded in next BFO cycle.
 - Have a screening model, or a complex model. Determine if air quality is an issue of a specific project and could choices be made to make it more air quality friendly.

Affordable Housing Strategic Plan

- Utilities were not addressed. Talked about mortgages, but not full cost of housing. Green buildings not accounted for. Needs definition of affordability.
- Connects to transportation. Do those in affordable housing have connections to transportation? Sidewalks that go to metro are not maintained in poorest neighborhoods.

- When select where to develop, FCHA looks at transit access.
- Examples of affordable neighborhoods on Vine that are hard to get to. More recent projects are sited for multimodal.

Clean Power Plan

- Working to stay abreast of how it will unfold in Colorado. Webinar on Friday. City needs to clarify relationship with Platte River as plan unfolds and comments are provided. Board can invite Platte River to speak on resource plan and Clean Power Plan.
 - Important to have state health department or EPA representative to speak. Get educated before taking a position.
 - Could get basic information from CDPHE.

ACTION ITEM: Lucinda will find out timeframe and determine who to invite to speak.

AGENDA ITEM 4: Futures Actions and Agenda Items

Review of City Council 6 Month Agenda Planning Calendar

- Sept 29: ESD Strategic Plan Work Session
 - Board can take position before Nov 17 adoption.
- Oct 6: Affordable Housing Strategic Plan
- Oct 13: Community Recycling Center, Recycling Ordinance, Water Efficiency Plan
- Nov 3: Annual Appropriation Ordinance
- Dec 1: Dust Control Manual

Agenda Planning

- Oct: ESD Strategic Plan
- Oct: Transportation Manual
- Nov: Elizabeth Street enhanced travel corridor
- Nov: Dust Control Manual/Fugitive Dust
- Unscheduled: Train Derailment—emergency planning for hazardous materials spill
 - Trains and other conveyances. What is the threat, plan for dealing with threat, etc.?
- Unscheduled: CAP periodic updates/Platte River presentation

ACTION ITEM: Lucinda will ask Mike or Ron to present on train derailment air quality threats. Will plan with Mark in advance.

Meeting Adjourned: 8:14pm

Next Meeting: October 19