

**MINUTES  
CITY OF FORT COLLINS  
AIR QUALITY ADVISORY BOARD**

**Date:** Monday, August 17, 2015  
**Location:** Community Room, 215 N. Mason Street  
**Time:** 5:30–8:00pm

**For Reference**

John Shenot, Chair  
Ross Cunniff, Council Liaison 970-420-7398  
Melissa Hovey, Staff Liaison 970-221-6813

**Board Members Present**

John Shenot, Chair  
Rich Fisher  
Tom Griggs  
Mark Houdashelt  
Jim Dennison  
Vara Vissa (arrived 5:40)

**Board Members Absent**

Robert Kirkpatrick  
Gregory Miller

**Staff Present**

Melissa Hovey, Senior Environmental Planner  
Dianne Tjalkens, Admin/Board Support  
Lucinda Smith, Environmental Services Director  
John Phelan, Energy Services Manager  
Rebecca Everette, City Planner

**Staff Absent**

**Councilmembers Present**

**Guests**

Peter O’Neill, Energy Board Chair  
Phil Friedman, Energy Board Vice Chair

---

**Call to order:** 5:36pm

**Public Comments:** None

**Staff Updates:** None

**Review and Approval of Minutes:**

Rich moved and Mark seconded a motion to approve the July 2015 AQAB minutes as amended.

Motion passed unanimously, 5-0-0. Vara arrived after vote.

Corrections: Downtown Development Plan—statement that transportation focused on trucks. Should say focused on parking, bikes and pedestrians.

---

**AGENDA ITEM 1: Draft Energy Policy**

*Staff from the Utilities, Customer Connections department responded to questions and comments on the draft Energy Policy presented by the Air Quality Advisory Board. The board will asked follow-up questions and discussed its final recommendations and the content of a memo on the Energy Policy to be sent to the Energy Board and City Council.*

John Phelan thanked board for thoughtful input on Energy Policy draft. Broadening of scope requires this type of collaboration and input. Since April meeting have been substantive revisions. The document is short and succinct: total of 14 pages. Last version was 5. How it fits into planning and implementation/level of detail—the intent is policy level guidance and does not include specifics of how to implement or reach goals; provides direction to departments that impact metrics. Implementation has historically happened through budgeting process. There is annual reporting on the policy that has a variety of metrics. Having an implementation plan is a new concept. The Energy Policy touches on many departments and will provide guidance on city plans, utilities, relationships with Platte River, planning, etc. It will be embedded in plans of other departments. Energy Board will write prioritized list by end of year which may guide implementation/action plans. Desire to become more action oriented.

### **Comments/Q&A**

- AQAB shares interest in becoming more action oriented. Common ground.
- Policy is a guide and will be dispersed into other plans/issues. Need interaction at implementation step.
  - Incumbent on staff to do that over time. As City Plan and other plans come up for review they will become more aligned with the Energy Policy.
  - Energy Board reviews City plans to ensure alignment.
- Implementation plan sounds like a great idea when feasible. When you don't have one to say how to accomplish goals, may be tendency for lofty goals to slip through the cracks or not be addressed. Has this been an issue in the past?
  - Best way to address this is an identified set of metrics. Are developing those and will bring to Council.
  - Should the AQAB take a look at the air quality side of the report annually?
    - Energy Board would most likely ask for assistance from City staff for metrics. For transportation air quality impacts, should have a manual soon.
  - Can send 2014 Energy Policy annual update to AQAB. Electricity GHG emissions would be only metric related to air quality in the last report.
    - This board might add recommendations around air quality metrics.
- Has there been discussion around the overlap of various boards and policies? AQAB is dealing with transportation, so is Energy Board.
  - Lot of discussion that led to metrics being embedded into departments that affect change.
  - Boards can influence each other. Need to jointly develop metrics.
    - This policy says next version of Transportation Master Plan will develop metrics for transportation.
- Which comments from AQAB does the Energy Board agree with, what can be added/changed?
  - August meeting Energy Board approved policy to go to Council, but have realized have time to make some additional changes in the September meeting. Bringing to Council Work Session so will be more changes. Will be adopted by resolution at a regular Council meeting. That is the point at which the AQAB can make a recommendation for adoption. Can also bring board comments to Work Session.

### **Discussion of Previously Submitted Board Comments**

- Board comment on adding educational institutions: Can look at changing language. Not material effect on policy. Comment on cleaner fuels for transportation—fuel diversity and local energy are in policy for cleaning up electric system. Not called out for transportation system. Graphic in draft addresses interdependency and interaction. Can add bullet around electrification of transportation as electric supply gets cleaner.
  - High percentage of coal in electric system now. As clean that up, electrification makes more sense.
  - Need to start now toward transportation electrification to get momentum/higher adoption rates for time when electric supply is cleaner.
  - Transportation and land use—can add something about smart growth.
    - Have smart growth in text. Debate about how much net growth is desirable, smart or not. Growth impacts GHG goals. Land use affects transportation.

- Land use impacts VMT.
- Comment on NGOs not listed as potential partners: Under partnerships section added other government and community organizations.
- Comment on vision statement about leadership in demonstration: Hesitant to add to vision statement but is an area Council has been consistent in messaging, so will look for places to add this language.
  - Vision statements are typically pie in the sky targets.
- Discussion on motivations for it to be viewed as an extension of CAP. References CAP, but bullet list shows better balance. Would like to go through it again to make broader.
  - Take out first paragraph and leave bullet list.
- AQAB does not want to de-emphasize reducing GHG, but don't want all other objectives secondary to that one.
  - Other issues are already well maintained so don't need the emphasis GHG has.
    - Energy Board has been having similar discussion.
    - CAP has been big driver of previous versions of Energy Policy. Electric supply is major source of emissions.
      - Reliability, affordability, safety, etc. are very important. Many other benefits in addition to GHG reduction. Need to be aware of how perceived among all members of community.
    - Substantive revision to acknowledge role/ownership of GHG emissions as part-owner of Platte River. Community inventory is based on use. But also have responsibility in energy produced on our behalf that we don't use.
      - Graphics are all about GHG.
      - Intent around characterization in GHG units is to provide snapshot of areas that need to be addressed. RMI did some other representations but data is aging/less accurate. Want to use metrics with solid data bases; need to replicate and track. Policy asks for those tracking tool to be developed.
  - Don't have good representation of fuel mix?
    - For electricity have it exactly, but for transportation have estimates of VMT and mix of vehicles, but not measured.
  - Document is sending a signal that energy is all about GHG.
    - Want to talk about sources, consumption, impact on economy, etc.
  - Energy Board can partially address comment. "Characterization" gives a picture of how Fort Collins uses energy.
    - Add description of implications to graphics.
    - Reflect transportation fuels in GHG inventory. Report inventory, so could extract estimates of fuels. Doesn't look at all alternative fuels, but there are ways to get a bit more detail.
  - Want to send message of balance between commercial, residential, and industrial, and various fuel sources.
    - If had same charts but instead of showing emissions, showed normalized use of energy would communicate what is most important.
      - Have a second set of graphs with megaBTUs for sources and uses.
    - If only broke down electricity sector, could see mixes.
    - Helpful suggested changes from reader standpoint, but from policy standpoint?
      - Can provide other items to Council during work session, annual reports, etc.
    - Suggest putting everything in source units.
- Comments on lacking measurable goals: Have added more specifics in most recent draft. Have also started developing metrics that would provide foundation for targets and goals—emissions, energy use, sector use, energy efficiency savings, electric supply diversity, etc. With regard to built environment and embodied energy in building roads, we don't have systems to account for that yet. Have discussed moving to a consumption based approach. Not sure can work into this version of the policy. Regarding Program Administrator Test, has not been a barrier at portfolio level to date.
- Comments on specific metrics for electric vehicles: Would rather have Transportation Master Plan develop specific metrics. Want to align over time. Can add education throughout document. Latest

version also mentions storage. At low level of renewable saturation in system now. Have time to determine where, how much and how important storage will be. No current targets.

- EVs and storage, would be helpful to add if under development or under purview of another sector. Explain why no goal included. EV is a big piece of transportation in CAP. Have big goal for 2030, but no interim goals. Would help groups like Drive Electric Northern Colorado if knew what City is shooting for.
  - Will be part of CAP implementation plan.
- Energy Board will look more at how to explain connections to other plans.
- Energy efficiency goals up through 2020, where do those come from?
  - Have added term “incremental savings” to home energy efficiency. We have been maintaining savings established in that program. By adding “incremental” address issue of making additional efficiencies. Will report total savings and incremental savings.
- Weighing in on Energy Policy is high priority for AQAB. How can board finalize its recommendations in light of new revisions before policy goes to Council?
  - Can AQAB have vote via email after review final draft?
    - Technically cannot vote via email. Consider crafting a resolution.
    - Vote on general outline of recommendation/memo and wordsmith later.
    - At beginning of recommendations can acknowledge that Energy Board may have addressed some of the comments. This is for Work Session.
  - Mark drafted memo in advance of meeting. Presented to board for review/edits.
  - Have to make motion that Energy Policy is adopted by Council.
    - Would prefer to send comments only to Energy Board, not Council. We are recommending the Energy Board make changes.
      - Work Session packet will include information on board and commission and public comment.
      - Primary role is to advise Council. Some value in sharing minutes of meeting with general recommendation.
        - Important to tailor comment so it can be sent to both the Energy Board and Council.
        - In charter to work with Energy Board, Transportation Board, and Planning and Zoning.
        - Give general recommendation and attach additional comments. Capture in public record regardless of how much Council will actually read.
        - None of the AQAB comments are so critical that would not recommend adoption of the policy if not addressed.
    - Draft recommendation was edited by board.

Jim moved and Rich seconded a motion to approve the drafted memo as a recommendation to Council.  
Motion passed unanimously, 6-0-0.

**ACTION ITEM:** Council recommendation will be distributed to Council and the Energy Board.

---

## **AGENDA ITEM 2: Downtown Plan**

*Rebecca Everette, City Planner, led a discussion on the visioning phase of the Downtown Planning process. The board provided input on this phase of the planning effort to affect consideration of air quality issues early in the process. The board may draft a memo regarding comments and suggestions to address air quality issues in the plan.*

Plan focuses on commercial core and guides decisions on capital projects, land use code changes, regulations, funding, etc. Last plan was done in 1989 and focused on revitalization. Have removed some residential areas from boundary and those are included in other plans. Key choices, policy decisions, etc. that need to be made. Have done a lot of public engagement and have working groups which include staff and

citizens. Topic area—Energy and Environment: showcasing and protecting Poudre corridor, stormwater management, and pursuing innovative pilot projects at district scale. Strong tie into Utilities. Mapping EV charging stations, solar arrays, ClimateWise business partners, etc. Opportunities to work toward all CAP emission reduction strategies in downtown including reducing waste, increasing uptake of renewables, reducing VMT, etc. Character District Design Charrette September 15 and community event September 24.

### Comments/Q&A

- The board has had issues to being asked to weigh in on plans after they are fully drafted and have asked Rebecca here because the plan is early in the process. Would like to have her provide updates periodically.
- Would like to see new hotel at Armadillo site as zero carbon building with solar or green roof, bikes, EV rental in garage. Visitors will just be going around the city. Would like to see everything brought together in that building. Other opportunities include new building at Perkins site and Sports Authority building when it moves to the mall. At Lincoln Center plan event attendees voted on items; is the City actually considering redoing sidewalks in downtown? Already developed. How do you change these?
  - Downtown area is very large, much bigger than Old Town. Some strategies might be for areas where currently there are no sidewalks, like near Innosphere. Not envisioning changes to streetscape in Old Town. For redevelopment, plan helps work with developer on vision. Would love to be able to incorporate more green building strategies in development. If have recommendations on incentives, regulations, etc., those would be welcome. The City has few regulations related to green building at this time.
- Mix of commercial and residential?
  - Primarily commercial. Some condos above commercial.
    - Can pilot projects that if work can move to residential. Ex: waste reduction/composting. Have several smaller composters/waste diversions as pilots. Less regulatory pushback than in residential area for piloting.
- Berlin has restaurants with gazebos and seating. More pedestrian areas, not just built environment and parking. Area could be more pedestrian focused with satellite parking. For seniors and disabled could have golf carts, etc. More public spaces, less commercial. We don't have a lot of museums.
- Vision is where want to be even if can't get there. All agree it's best to have zero emission vehicles in downtown area. A tactic could be to require satellite delivery points to get large trucks out of the area. Will continue to get hotter in cities. Find ways to prevent heat islands: surfaces that are not as absorbent of heat for sidewalks. Make rooftops greener, reflective of heat. Lighting—pay more attention to night sky; people can get around well with less light. Keep sufficient for security.
  - Natural Areas is working on a dark skies policy that would address this issue citywide.
  - Deliveries by drones may be an opportunity.
- Have little confidence that the city is prepared for a train derailment or hazardous waste spill. Needs to be addressed in downtown vision. Be prepared and make sure it never happens. Have had vision of zero energy district, FortZED. Good vision that should tie into all new buildings. Vision for downtown is one where we have made huge strides in indoor air quality, including radon, lead paint, asbestos, mold, and other indoor air pollutants. No one working in or visiting downtown should have to worry about indoor air quality, which we can control.
  - Uphill battle. Would not deny need for this. But how can a plan create enforceable action for indoor air quality. There are no standards for mold in Colorado. Existing rules for radon, lead paint and asbestos. This would have to be citywide, not district by district.
    - Innovative projects. Not suggesting standards should be different in downtown than the rest of the city. Some issues are more an older-building phenomenon. Plan needs to address indoor air quality in some way.
- People enjoy downtown for small, local, unique shops. May be a little more expensive, but a large draw. To what extent can City planners ensure the kinds of development that go on in the rest of the city complement downtown to keep them from jeopardizing the small local businesses?
  - Have had a lot of comments about protecting unique and eclectic, and keeping out chain stores.

- Downtown can represent what we want the rest of the city to do. City within a city to showcase everything that can come. In Abu Dhabi demo buildings every 20 years. Cannot foresee what will happen in technology, and retrofitting can be expensive.
- River District is being enhanced, protected. Permeable surfaces impact water quality and flow.
  - A lot of downtown area is in flood plain. Stormwater management is critical in this area.
- Smoke, dust and unnecessary combustion of fossil fuels. Get over trend of backyard fire pits and wood stoves. Lots of complaints on wood combustion smoke. Fugitive dust during construction. Natural gas fire pit in middle of downtown renovation.
- Online survey available.
- Board will need to discuss at what point and in which areas it should weigh in on the plan.
  - Give early input at transitions between planning phases.
  - Final plan will be very specific. Closest model is West Central Area Plan. Will include policy and implementation phasing.

ACTION ITEM: Rebecca will provide updates to the board before the first draft is written and when it is completed.

### **AGENDA ITEM 3: Environmental Services Strategic Plan**

*Lucinda Smith, Environmental Services Director, led a discussion on the draft Strategic Plan for Environmental Services. Discussion focused on the air quality and climate action themes and priorities.*

Lucinda provided one page summary to board. Each department in Sustainability Services is developing a strategic plan, organized into themes. ESD has a history of having strategic plans; this plan is bringing under one umbrella, integrating programs, and integrating with other sustainability departments. Five themes with multiple goals in each theme, and strategies within. Be Air Aware includes strategies around ozone, coordinating with other departments, understanding health impacts, and looking at social trends' impact on air quality. Leveraging air quality benefits of climate action initiatives. Focus on local actions that will reduce air pollutants such as ozone and radon. Lead of Example includes promoting sustainability within the organization, education, etc. Collaborate and Act Regionally has goals around deep carbon reduction measures, participating in legislation and regulatory processes, etc.

#### **Comments/Q&A**

- Leadership is really the key. To get people onboard, get respected people in the community. Mobilize people who are marginally interested by engaging key figures.
  - Can add that into strategies around marketing.
- Integration of triple bottom line, but air quality part of plan does not emphasize enough economic impacts of bad air quality.
  - See that playing out in strategies, or need to provide more education to public?
    - Raise awareness. In air quality need to connect dots for people on economics.
- Annual audit with metrics?
  - Annual status reports on community reductions, municipal goals, and ambient air quality.
  - Might be useful to evaluate how far you've come on all goals.
    - Look at results and be more reflective on number compared to goal as well as whether doing right things to reach goals.
      - Something for staff to evaluate if helpful, and if have time.
    - In planning processes, look at approaches.
- Road to Zero Waste—recycling returns are poor, international markets are fluctuating. Our own recycling center has stalled, and our landfill has lost income from recycling. Message for recycling should be more about reducing further upstream. Recycling should be only if there are no other options. Regional collaborations mean that other people's problems become our problem, such as the landfill, and only regional composter is in Denver. Can Colorado do something more where community problems intersect?
  - Regional issues in waste diversion allow economies of scale and funding large scale projects. Coordinating strongly regionally on these issues.

- Next month Caroline Mitchell will come to discuss Community Recycling Ordinance.
- Making good progress on waste diversion rate. On track to meet 2020 goals. Addressing solutions.
- Coordination amongst various City departments is critical. Ex: Affordable Housing Strategic Plan does not have anything addressing green building. Adaptation in general, especially with development by the river. Request to learn more about the triple bottom line process and how decisions are made when pieces are in conflict.
- Work Session September 22. October would be good time for revisit to AQAB.

ACTION ITEM: Lucinda will give an update in October.

---

#### **AGENDA ITEM 4: Updates and Announcements**

##### **Superboard Meeting**

- Not discussed.

##### **Climate Action Plan Implementation**

- Lucinda taking update to Council Work Session September 8.
- Executive team will present initial strategies. Get feedback on 2020 plans.
- More substantive update at September meeting.

##### **Dust Prevention and Control**

- December 1 to Council. Added an additional working group meeting to discuss the manual.
- No new activity since last AQAB meeting.
- John and Jim will discuss offline to select which meeting to discuss further.

##### **Transportation Air Quality Impacts Guidance Manual**

- Met with consultant which spurred new ideas. Will share soon.
- John and Lucinda will collaborate on how to give input.

##### **Clean Power Plan**

- Link included in email packet. Milestone. Implementation will be state level.

##### **Community Recycling Ordinance**

- September agenda item. Presentation by Caroline Mitchell.
- 

#### **AGENDA ITEM 5: Futures Actions and Agenda Items**

##### **Review of City Council 6 Month Agenda Planning Calendar**

- September 8: CAP
- September 22: Energy Policy and Environmental Services Strategic Plan
- October 13: Work Session Community Recycling Ordinance

##### **September Agenda**

- CAP Implementation
- Fugitive Dust
- Community Recycling Ordinance

##### **Other**

- Need to address train derailment issue.
- 

**Meeting Adjourned: 8:19pm**

**Next Meeting:** September 16