

**MINUTES
CITY OF FORT COLLINS
AIR QUALITY ADVISORY BOARD**

Date: Monday, May 18, 2015
Location: Community Room, 215 N. Mason Street
Time: 5:30–8:00pm

For Reference

John Shenot, Chair
Ross Cunniff, Council Liaison 970-420-7398
Melissa Hovey, Staff Liaison 970-221-6813

Board Members Present

John Shenot, Chair
Robert Kirkpatrick
Tom Griggs
Mark Houdashelt
Gregory Miller
Jim Dennison
Vara Vissa

Board Members Absent

Rich Fisher

Staff Present

Dianne Tjalkens, Admin/Board Support
Lucinda Smith, Director of Environmental Services

Staff Absent

Melissa Hovey, Senior Environmental Planner

Councilmembers Present

Guests

John Faust (arrived 6:00)

Call to order: 5:31pm.

Public Comments:

None

Review and Approval of Minutes

Greg moved and Tom Griggs seconded a motion to approve the April 2015 AQAB minutes as amended.
Motion passed unanimously, 6-0-0. Robert arrived after vote.

AGENDA ITEM 1: Climate Action Plan (CAP) Implementation

Lucinda Smith, Director of Environmental Services led the board in a discussion of the CAP Framework process and what's next for CAP implementation.

Strategies/Framework Basics:

Goals adopted: 20% below 2005 level by 2020; 80% by 2030; carbon neutral 2050
Plan is high level, will require updates; each action requires approval and budgeting.

Areas:

1. Buildings: natural gas and electric use in residential, commercial, industrial.
 - a. New buildings: driving to net zero.
 - b. Existing building: commercial and industrial (codes, incentives, etc.)
2. Transportation

- a. Ways to drive less (multimodal transportation, reducing driving)
 - b. Ways to reduce emissions as driving (fuel efficient and electric vehicles)
3. Energy Supply
- a. Working with Platte River for utility scale (bringing on more renewables)
 - b. Advance solar and other renewables
 - c. Shift heat load from natural gas to alternatives

Formed a CAP Core team with staff from many departments. Institute for Built Environment is facilitating Strat Ops process which is intensive strategic planning. Need to advance implementation and have early wins. Will develop 6–10 strategic initiatives, then begin working. Have support from LEAD team, Jeff Mihelich, Jackie Kozak-Thiel, and Kevin Gertig. Melissa Hovey will be project manager for CAP implementation. Determining process for giving regular updates to Council and public. Budget requests/funding: 1) Off-cycle request in July for developing engagement plan; 2) Mid-cycle offers for implementation; 3) BFO 2017/18; 4) Grant funding. Work Session September 8.

Comments/Q&A

- Has Platte River talked about solar thermal for storage?
 - Platte River is doing integrated resource planning, looking at range of alternative sources. Focusing on scaling back from Craig coal plant and how to fill gap. Surplus sales keep our rates lower. Solar thermal, biofuels, CNG all on list of alternatives they have explored.
- Hydro does not count toward renewables, but EPAs clean energy?
 - Not at this time. More work to do there.
- How does board productively engage in process? Help with outreach, public engagement, analytics?
- Will it be citizen, business, or City-driven implementation?
 - City will identify initiatives, but can't be just City implementing. Forming a citizen advisory committee to collaborate with staff (not Council advisory). More info in June. Also working with A-Train Marketing (already working with Lose A Watt and FortZED) to tie all programs together. Jeni Cross helping social/behavior change aspect. Also developing additional metrics and interim milestones. Involving businesses, nonprofits, ClimateWise partners, etc. to create shared ownership.
- Connection between conventional air pollutants and GHG pollutants. Messaging could be more effective if traditional air quality benefits are highlighted: visibility, respiratory illness, etc. Board can help.
 - Potential for additional forums similar to one board hosted last year. Individuals can be ambassadors. Elevator speech. Key messages to repeat. Utilities completing customer survey on communication.
- Integration is important. Programs are outstanding, but not sufficient uptake in community: on-bill financing, Lose A Watt, etc. How to increase visibility and adoption? What are potential roadblocks to reach goals?
 - All strategies need work. Energy supply is biggest area. Direction of Platte River, coordination between co-owners of Platte River, need to communicate and support other 3 cities. Something will happen with Craig, but what next? In community, will be update to building code this year. Ahead of curve based on models in effectiveness of energy efficiency program. With sustained focus can stay ahead of curve, but will only moderate growth. Drive Electric Northern Colorado helpful. New Green Built Environment Coordinator starting in June.
 - Looking at using EPA's energy management portfolio for large buildings?
 - Energy disclosure should be looked at. Would like apartment complexes to advertise energy efficiency.
- Requests of the board?
 - Participate in or review information from focus groups to help with marketing to community. Be ambassador. Take positions on budget items.
 - Possible to test air quality messages on focus groups?
 - Yes. Purpose of focus groups is to extract what types of messages will be most compelling. Have simulations of visibility, health, etc. Unsure of effectiveness.

- With Council changes, do you change messaging?
 - Staff will get summary of Council retreat. What initiatives do they want to focus on? Will give insight. Mayor is talking about CAP and energy.
- If we reduce coal burning will improve health of communities where plants are located. Data.
 - If Platte River reduces generation at Craig, will it get shut down or sold to someone else? State level, how to do affect greatest change? How do you message different goals for City and Platte River?
- Glen (advisory committee member) was pushing for consumption-based accounting. Moving forward?
 - June 9 meeting will discuss. Staff team will look at options. Lifecycle impact of power generation is another option. Can use more than one tool in smaller pieces. Will develop recommendation for pathway.

ACTION ITEM: Board can develop messaging on air quality that staff can run through focus groups. Members send suggestions to John. He will organize vetting and send final to Melissa. Lucinda will provide co-benefits slide to John.

AGENDA ITEM 2: Transportation Air Quality Impacts Guidance Manual

John Shenot, Chair, led the board in a discussion on this topic including a list of questions that the manual should try to address and input to assist staff in developing a Scope of Work for an RFP from qualified contractors.

Consultant to be hired by December to develop manual. Board can help with initial framing/scoping so contractors can understand project in bidding. RFP late summer/early fall. Develop list of questions. Answering the questions would guide manual product. John drafted list of questions. Other suggestions include identifying audience, purpose, basic design/organization (ex: include triage tool at beginning), having a schedule for development of handbook, reviewing outline before draft, identifying acute events/emergency response vs. ongoing problems.

Comments/Q&A

- Manual should address transportation related to new projects such as schools and malls. They are indirectly responsible for understanding how much that entity will contribute to air quality impacts. What VMTs will be produced as a result of the operation? The business should be responsible for using the manual.
 - The manual users are City employees and contractors. Focused on City projects. Board should also give opinion on these items.
- With respect to definition of projects: include transportation projects and projects with impacts to transportation. Size needs to be defined. There are criteria for when a project needs a transportation impact analysis; perhaps use same threshold.
 - Development project? transportation/infrastructure?
- Will assessments be used to approve, reject, or choose between projects, or just to say what the impacts will be?
 - If impacts are bad, do they adjust project?
 - Violation of standards: yes. Need to understand net effect as well. Sustainability assessment runs into same issues. Manual should inform sustainability assessment.
- Read BFO offer: specifics are there, gives good direction. Ex: Mall in Midtown—what do we anticipate air quality impacts to be? Focused on major development or transportation projects.
 - Need criteria to decide what projects. Ex: small projects such as Mulberry bridge replacement have major impacts (time scales, impacts, etc.).
 - Use of manual most likely won't lead to red light/green light especially in terms of public safety. That part is not up to this board.
 - Determine practical aspects: instruments to use, data to collect, what to measure, etc.
 - Manual is what needs to be assessed and how.

- Construction or what happens after project is complete? Assume both. Manual may have different ways of assessing those impacts. Make this part clear.
- What are impacts/air pollutants that need to be assessed? Close to 200 regulated pollutants.
 - Includes GHGs?
 - Yes. But list pollutants to assess, or more open-ended? Scope questions.
- If manual describes process to do assessment, then City is doing assessment and paying for it. Alternatively, those completing project assess impacts and staff person determines if reasonable.
 - BFO does not describe who will perform assessment, but says to develop policy manual and training for City staff.
- Have positive impacts identified as well, such as with MAX. Post-project verification.

ACTION ITEM: John will forward Rich's email to the board.

ACTION ITEM: Continue discussion via email. John will lead.

AGENDA ITEM 3: Fugitive Dust Pilot Project

The board discussed the summer pilot project and provided input on pilot design and working with an advisory group to advance the fugitive dust ordinance.

City leadership decided to push fugitive dust ordinance to back-burner in short term. Melissa has been asked to design and implement testing of best practices this summer with limited projects. Melissa provided a pilot outline and questions for members.

Comments/Q&A

- Are impacts correct ones to measure?
 - Cost, who determines? Can quantify delay (time) in terms of costs. What is criterion for how significant impacts are? Stormwater is about conflict. Would have to be resolved so not violating stormwater requirements. Find better way to describe.
 - List is based on feedback from outreach process which included public and contractors.
 - What are air quality impacts? Opacity? Type of particles?
 - Need clarity.
 - Air monitoring for airborne dust. PM10? PM2.5? Also discusses visual parameter. Amend to air quality *and* visual impact.
- How will Melissa hear these comments?
 - John and Lucinda will email notes to Melissa. Minutes will capture comments.
- What projects?
 - City involved. Also, Melissa has contacted developers for voluntary participation. Ask what is already being done and what new methods contractors are putting in place as result of manual.
 - Data sheet presumes doing nothing to start. Should record all methods in place.
- Data fields capture enough to measure variables? Suggestions for measuring variables? Suggestions for methodology?
- Project List: Does it cover all dust activities? Grinding, cutting, etc.?
 - Goal, but may not be able to identify project in each category.
 - Projects have significant variables including wind speed and work practices of contractor/developer. How compliant to new measures? Do they have equipment to implement? Variables that affect post-test as well. Ex: humidity, clay soils. Small data set with much variability. Easy to draw false conclusions. More robust data in literature? Better to mine data rather than doing work?
 - Context is Council has directed to pilot in advance of adopting an ordinance.
 - Need feasibility on usefulness of this data collection.
 - Melissa has had similar concerns and is addressing them.
 - Don't get too focused on quantitative measurement of pilot projects. Look at time and money to implement best practices.

- Analyze baseline on project 1 to same project implementing best practices. Field notes. How many steps going to change? Run for 1 hour, ½ day, 3 days?
- If do tests and don't have enough data, could staff go back to Council with that?
 - Dust Working Group is stakeholders who have interest in outcome. Can talk to operators. Qualitative. Council not expecting statistical data for each activity. Get experience with how onerous vs. how effective. Have stakeholders see how implemented by other operators.
- Council compromise is the pilot. Must comply with Council's process or they will not enact an ordinance.
- Will a member of the board volunteer to be on the Dust Working Group?
 - Jim has dust monitoring equipment and will be on working group.
- Can citizens be invited to participate or have a survey?
 - Dust Working Group will have citizens.
 - Survey was already done.
 - On these 12 projects?
 - Can involve neighbors and businesses with project specific pre-survey.

ACTION ITEM: Jim will be on Dust Working Group

AGENDA ITEM 4: Other Business

Energy Policy

- Council Work Session September 22
- Last month did not see draft policy. Have invited Energy Board to return to AQAB to share draft when available. May seek endorsement at that time.
 - Request draft before meeting to have time to review.

New Staff

- Peter Gibbons, ½ Time Air Quality Planner, May 26
- Tony Raker, Green Built Environment Coordinator, June 8
 - AQAB supported BFO offer for this position. Will make a big difference.

Downtown Plan

- Melissa will provide information on planned public events.
- Online survey available now.

Oil and Gas Reports and Forum

- Press release today for public forum June 4, 6:00-8:00pm, Council Chambers, to share results of 3 reports: 1) Property values; 2) Availability of health impacts data; 3) Air quality sampling. Consultants will be speaking. Summaries and reports available online.

West Nile Virus (WNV)

- Prevention campaigns underway.
- WNV is ongoing subject at AQAB due to ecological and human health impacts of spraying pesticides.

Loss a Watt

- Started early February. WorkWise challenge to get employees involved. More information online. Katy Bigner could share more with board at June meeting. Targeted, specific way to get engaged in CAP.

Review of City Council 6 Month Agenda Planning Calendar

- Environmental Services Strategic Plan: Work Session September 22. Can present to board July or August.
- Railroad study to relieve congestion.

June Agenda

- John will finalize agenda via email. Using priorities input from members to set agendas. Requests ongoing member input. Transportation Manual, Fugitive Dust Pilot Projects, and CAP will be recurring. Timely and in work plan.
- John not available June 15. Mark is requested to chair in his absence. Important to RSVP for meetings. Tom Moore resigned, so eight members. Need 5 for quorum.
 - Movement on filling open position?
 - Staff will check with City Clerk's Office.
- List of lesser important items to accomplish this year?
 - Sent email listing possibilities and requesting feedback on prioritization.
 - Can set definitive list next meeting?
 - Yes, and will need to evolve as needed to provide advice to staff/Council.
 - Emergency planning for significant train issue with hazardous chemicals included?
 - On list.
 - Add deadlines for non-negotiables to list.
 - Train idling: add to list.
- Air Quality Plan Update?
 - Might be done with City Plan update in 2017.

ACTION ITEM: John will revise list and share with board via email. Board members will review and provide feedback/input.

Meeting Adjourned: 8:07pm

Next Meeting: June 15